

The semantic shift of “Samain” from Summer to Winter.

Bearnard Ó Muireagáin

Abstract: The aim of the paper is to inform the reader to the semantic shift which moved Samain from the start of summer to the start of winter. Additionally offer an explanation to when the semantic shift occurred and how it happened. In doing so improve the comprehension of Gaelic mythology.

Keywords: Samhain, All Saints’ Day, All Martyrs’ Day, Lughnasad, Beltaine

Bearnard Ó Muireagáin
Independent Researcher

1. The problem of *Samain* and the evidence of semantic shift

OIr. *Samain* is from the same root as OIr. *Sam* “summer”,¹ PIE **seim*. And its antithesis²: OIr. *Gamain* is from the same root as OIr. *Gaim*, “winter”,³ PIE **gheim*.

Summer and winter are binary opposites in the Indo-European tradition and should not occur at the same time, i.e., winter cannot be in summer, and summer cannot be in winter. Hence from an etymological development point of view *Samain* could not have originally been at the same time as *Gamain* within the Goidelic calendar.

¹ Carey, Sequence and Causation in Echtra Nerai, *Ériu*, 39 (1988), 71

² Carey, Sequence and Causation in Echtra Nerai *Ériu*, 39 (1988), 71

³ “OIr. knows three variants of the word “winter”: *gaim* (oldest nom. sg.; also in compound *gaimred* in the phrase *a n-gaimred* “this winter”; the second component has its origin in *ráithe* “season”), *gem* (in compounds of the type of *gem-adaig* “winter night”) and *gam* (with vocalism evidently affected by the word *sam* “summer”). The latest stem probably appears in the Ogam personal name *Gami-cunas* (Ziegler 1994, 105; Matasovic 2009, 170). Schrijver (1995, 108-10) supposes forms *gaim* & *gem* reflecting an original *i* stem with a root vowel **-e-* of the type of OIr. *daig*, gen. *dego* “flame”, *tailm*, gen. *telmo* “loop”, so perhaps nom. *gaim*, gen. **gemo*. Schrijver reconstructs the basic image of the form **gem-i-* < **giem-i-*. On the other hand, de Bernardo Stempel (1999, 36) supposes that *gem* reflects an old gen. sg. **ghim-os* (also in compound *gem-red*). OWelsh *gaem*, MWelsh *gaeaf* m. represent the closest parallels and in compound *gaeaw-rawd* the corresponding OIr. *gaim-red*; then, OCorn. *goyf* gl. ‘hyemps’, Corn. *gwaf*, OBret. *gouiam*, MBret. *gouaff*, Bret. *gouañv*, dial. (Vanetais) *gouiañ* “autumn” (Deshayes 2003, 280) < Brit. **giiamV-* < **ghiem-* (Schrijver 1995, 101, 108-10). Cp. further Ir. *Gamain* “November”; the name of the month **giamonios* in the Gaulish calendar from Coligny formally corresponds to it (in fact, it is preserved at the different stages of shortening: *giamoni*, *giamon*, *giamo*, *giam*, *gia*), all from Celt. **gi(i)amo* < **ghiem-* (Schrijver 1995, 101, 109; Pinault 1993, 152 still follows the traditional reconstruction **ghiom-*.”

Lenka Dočkalová, Václav Blazek, *The Indo-European Year*, The Journal of Indo-European Studies Volume 39, Number 3 & 4 (Fall/Winter 2011), 440-1.

Gamain according to the 9th century *Sanas Cormaic* is the name for month of November, which is also called ‘*mi gaim*’, ‘month of winter’ and related to term *Gemred*, ‘the season of winter’. *Gamain*, *mi gaim* and *Gemred* all start on November 1st.

Sanas Cormac’s entry⁴ for *Gamain*:

B: “Gamuin .i. immí gam .i. iar samuin. inde dicitur gámnach [ED.gam-sinech] .i. iarsinní is blichtur immi gaim .i. in gamrid.”

M: “Gamain .i. in mí gaim iar samuin, unde dicitur gamnach .i. gam-sinech .i. arinni is mblicht i mmi gaim .i. i ngaimreth.”

Y: “Gamain .i. imi gaim iar samain unde gamnach arindi as mlucht imingam mi gaimraith.”

Translation:

“*Gamuin*, i.e. in the month of *Gam*, i.e., after *Samuin*; whence *gamnach*, i.e. winter-engorged teats, i.e., milk milked in the month of winter, i.e. in the season of winter.”

Sanas Cormac’s entry⁵ for *Gam*:

B: “Gam ab eo quod est gamos grece unde etiam grece mulier nominatur .i. bean, unde bigamus uel trigamus dicitur.”

M: “Gam ab eo quod est gamos isin greic .i. nouember unde etiam mulieres ducunt imgamon 7”

Y: “Gam quasi gamos isin greic, nouimber, unde ueteri mulieres ducunt .i. mi gam on.”

Sanas Cormac’s entry⁶ for *Gamrith*:

Y: “Gaimrith quasi gaim-rith, unde dicitur Colman mac hui Clusaigh hi marbhnaidh Cuimine Fotæ Hua Corpre, hua Cuirc, ba sái, ba hán, bá hordric, dirsan marban im-mí gamh, ní liach, ní d’eccaib iaramh, .i. for nemh rainic.”

In regard to *Gemred*, O’Donovan in notes to *Sanas Cormac* read:

“*Mi gam* here certainly means the month of November, for S. Cumine Fota died on the 12th November, A. 1). 661.—O’D.”⁷

⁴ Early Irish Glossaries Database (Online at <http://www.asnc.cam.ac.uk/irishglossaries/>) accessed 31 10 2015

⁵ Early Irish Glossaries Database (Online at <http://www.asnc.cam.ac.uk/irishglossaries/>) accessed 31 10 2015

⁶ Early Irish Glossaries Database (Online at <http://www.asnc.cam.ac.uk/irishglossaries/>) accessed 31 10 2015

⁷ Whitley Stokes, *Sanas Cormac: Cormac’s glossary, translated and annotated by late John O’Donovan LL.D.*, (Calcutta 1868), 82

The electronic Dictionary of Irish Language Dictionary (eDIL), defines *gamain* as:

November: *g. n̄ .i. in mí gaim iar samuin*, Corm. Y 687.⁸

Given that November is the time of *gamain* and the month of *giam* and start of *gamrith*. The placement of *Samain*, the binary opposition to *gamain*, on November 1st conflicts with *Samain*'s etymological origin and must be a result of a semantic shift in its usage.⁹

The original meaning of *Samain* places it in opposition to *Gamain*, i.e. November, and so *Samain* should be associated with the month of May, *Cet Shamain*, and the start of the season of *Samredh*.

In Old Irish the month of May was *Cet Shamain* 'the beginning of samain'.¹⁰ June was *mithemain*,¹¹ an exact cognate of the Brittonic word for 'June', meaning 'middle of *samain*'.¹² The use of *Samain* for the first month of summer and the middle month of summer implies that *Samain* was a synonym for the summer season, reflecting *Samain*'s original meaning.

That the feast day of called *Samain* is no longer within the season of *Samain* confirms a semantic shift that occurred after the word's formation.

2. The Semantic Shift of *Samain* only occurred in Goidelic speaking Celts

By a comparison with the cognates of *Samain* within other Celtic cultures, it is clear that the semantic shift of *Samain* (in regard to the feast day) is particular to the Goidelic speaking Celts.

The Brythonic cognate of Samain is 'heven'/'hefen'

C. Lainé-Kerjean identifies the Breton *heven* as a cognate of Gaulish *Samon*:

⁸ eDIL - Irish Language Dictionary (Online at <http://www.edil.qub.ac.uk>) accessed 31 10 2015

⁹ Dr. David Stifter, professor of Old Irish at National University of Ireland, Maynooth, "It is obvious that some semantic shift must have affected the word at some stage of its history". OLD-IRISH-L Archives, dated Tue 24 Dec 2013 14:46:33 (online at <https://listserv.heanet.ie/>) accessed on 31 10 2015

¹⁰ Carey, 'Sequence and Causation in Echtra Nerai', 71

¹¹ "mithem n n and i, m. midsummer; June (mod. Meitheamh). g s. secht mbarca cach mís mithemon (mithemain, St.), BDD 17. domnach i mmís mithemain, LL 44a37 (d s. in appos. ?). a mís Míthemain, Aisl. MC 85.4 . mis míthime (.i. . . a mi medhon-ach int samraid), Anecd. v 25 LL 44a37 & mís Míthemain in Aisl. MC 85.4 ."

eDIL - Irish Language Dictionary (Online at <http://www.edil.qub.ac.uk>) accessed 31 10 2015

“Nous ne pouvons que penser au breton trede noz heven hiniv (= la troisième nuit du SAMON aujourd'hui),...”¹³

Dr John Carey offers the Brythonic versions of Samain:

“From Kyntefin ‘1 May’ we can scarcely dissociate Welsh Mehefin, Breton Mezheven ‘June’ <*medio-samon- ‘middle of summer’,”

Welsh ‘*Hefin*’ is defined by *Geiriadur Prifysgol Cymru* (GPU) as:

“*Haf, tymor neu amser haf; yn perthyn i'r haf neu'n nodweddiadol ohono, hafaidd, tesog: summer, summer-time; pertaining to or characteristic of summer, aestival, hot, sunny.*”¹⁴

And related word ‘*Hafin*’ is defined:

“*Hin hafaidd, hinon haf, heulwen: fine or summer weather, the serene season of summer, sunshine.*”¹⁵

While older Welsh dictionaries define them thus:

William Owen, *A Dictionary of the Welsh Language, Explained in English, Volume 2, 1803*:

“*Havin, s. m. (hâv) Summer time; halcyon days. Un yw'r vun a vyz cyfevin, Gwenlliant lliw havin. One is the maid that be pre-eminent, Gwenlliaut of the hue of the summer day. M. ab Owain.*”

“*Hevin, a. (hâv) Estival, summer. Alban hevin, summer solstice; Alban arthan, the winter solstice.*”

Thomas Richards, *Antiquæ Linguæ Britannicæ Thesaurus: A Welsh and English Dictionary, 1815*:

“*Hafin, s. summer time, calmness. From Hâf and Hîn*”

These definition of the cognate of *Samain* can be compared to eDil’s Old Irish definition:

“The first of November, the festival held on that date, in relig. contexts All Saints’ Day, All Hallows.”¹⁶

¹³ C. Lainé-Kerjean, ‘Le Calendrier Celtique’, *Zeitschrift für celtische Philologie*, Volume 23, Issue 3, , 1943, 263

¹⁴ Geiriadur Prifysgol Cymru: The Dictionary of the Welsh Language (online at <http://www.geiriadur.ac.uk/gpc/gpc.html>) access on 31 10 2015

¹⁵ Geiriadur Prifysgol Cymru: The Dictionary of the Welsh Language (online at <http://www.geiriadur.ac.uk/gpc/gpc.html>) access on 31 10 2015

¹⁶ eDIL - Irish Language Dictionary (Online at <http://www.edil.qub.ac.uk>) accessed 31 10 2015

Byrthonic language maintains the original mean of *Samain*, and show no evidence of a semantic shift.

Nor is there evidence in Byrthonic culture for a pre-christain celebration associated with Irish semantically shifted feast of Samain. Professor Ronald Hutton, of History at Bristol University, writes:

“The Irish pattern of festivals is so often taken as typical of ‘the Celts’, from Ireland to the Alps, that it must be pointed out that the available evidence on the matter is inconclusive. The early Welsh literature ascribes no importance to 1 November, 1 February or 1 August, and all the emotional investment made by the Irish writers in Samhain is attached instead to May Day (Calan Mai) and the night before it.”¹⁷

The Brythonic Celts then have no semantic shift in the use of *Samain*, nor does there culture place importance on start of winter with a feast of *Samain*. Instead the Brythonic culture makes ‘all the emotional investment made by the Irish writers in *Samain*’ to the start of the season that the Irish call *Samain*, i.e. May and the start of summer.

This would imply that for Brythonic Celts their equivalent feast day of *Samain* was still associated with the first month of *Samain*, as is the same for the Gauls.

The Gaulish cognate of Samain is Samonios

Samonios is the first month of Gaulish *Coligny Calendar* and is opposite *Giamonios* (the Gaulish cognate of OIr. *gamain*) within the calendar, thus conforming to the expected binary opposition inherent in the etymology of the two words.

If the Gaulish month of *Giamonios* is identical etymologically to the Old Irish month of *Gamain*, i.e. November, then *Samonios* is equilevent by relative position and etymology to the Old Irish month of *Cet Shamain*. And within the month of *Samonios* is the day called ‘*Trinus Samonios*’, a cognate of the Old Irish ‘*Trenae Samna*’¹⁸. *Trenae Samna* being an alternative name for the feast day of *Samain*:

Serglige Con Culainn shows the associate between *Samain* and *Trenae Samna* thus:

“Oenach dognithe la Ultu cecha bliadna .i. tri la ria samfuin 7 tri laa iarma 7 lathe na samn feisne. Iss ed eret no bitis Ulaid insin i mMaig Murthemni, oc ferthain oenaig na samna cecha bliadna. Ocus ni rabe isin bith ni dognethe in n-eret sin leu acht cluchi 7 cheti 7 anius 7 aibinnius 7 longad 7 tomait, conid de sin atat na trenae samna sechnon na hErend.”¹⁹

¹⁷ Dr Ronald Hutton, *The Pagan Religions of the Ancient British Isles: their nature and legacy* (Wiley 1993), 176.

¹⁸ Françoise Le Roux, ‘Le calendrier gaulois de Coligny et la fête irlandaise de Samain’, *Ogam* 9 (1957), 339

¹⁹ Whitley Stokes, Ernst Windisch (eds), *Seirgligi Conculaind inso sis ocus Oenét Emire*, *Irishe texte* Vol 1 (Leipzig 1880), 205.

Translation:

“The Ultonians had a custom of holding a fair every year, which lasted the three days before Samhain [the first of November], the day of Samhain itself, and the three days that followed it. That was the period of time which the Ultonians devoted to the holding of the Fair of Samhain in the Plain of Muirtheimne every year ; and nothing whatever was done by them during that time but games and races, pleasure and amusement, and eating and feasting ; and it is from this circumstance that the Tertiae (three days) of Samhain are still observed throughout Erin..”²⁰

And reiterated in *Scél Na Samna* within the *Leabhar Breac*:

“Co ndendais na daine ídb(er)ta dona déib i llithláiti na samhna do g(re)s tar cenn a car(a)t 7 a coimhcchéil(e). Conadh de sin dogarar trenai na samhna dibh. Ic lamhghubai ar trein focul greghdha he as inann iar net(er)c(er)tfocail 7 lamentac(i)o .i. lamhcomairt .i. iarsan ní do nítis na daine ídhb(er)ta 7 gubhai ic cainedh a marbh innti 7 da nídenta ceisd ná caingin ele acasom acht sin nama isna trenuibh sin. Conad de sin bhat(ar) trenai occu cen na(ch) ngnímh ndiadhái ná ndaena do denamh indtibh ocna farrsaidibh 7 am(háin) sin bhéous ocon daescarshl(úag) tria ai(n)jeolus iar niris ná genntligheachta. Condat soerai beos trenai o{c}casom am(ail) sin cen na(ch) saethar do de(na)m inntibh. Bai dano temp(all) isin roimh ind inbh(aid) sin. Panteon a ainm.”

Translation:

“And the people would always make sacrifices to the gods on the feastday of Samhain for the sake of their friends and their companions. And it is from that, that the "trenai" of Samhain were named. To be lamenting (is) the meaning of the Greek noun which is the same in meaning of (the) word as 'lamentacio' i.e. 'lamhcomairt' 'hand-beating' (beating of the hands in grief) i.e. from the fact that the people would make offerings and lamentations in keening their dead during them and, moreover, neither enquiry nor other business would be made among them but only that (activity) during those "trenai." And from that they had "trenai", without any divine or human activity in them being done by the pharisees, and only that also by the common rabble, through ignorance after the belief of the pagans. So that, moreover, "trenai" are holidays they have like that, without any labor being done during them. There was also a temple in Rome at that time. Pantheon was its name.”²¹

There is a clear conflict between the pre-Christain Galluish Coligny Calendar placement of the feast day of *Samain* and the later Irish Christain calendar's placement:

Gaulish *Trinus Samonios* is in the month of *Samonios* (OIr. *Cet Shamain*).

Goidelic *Trenae Samna* is in the month of *Gamain* (Gaul. *Giamonios*).

²⁰Eugene O'Curry, 'The Sick-bed of Cuchulain', *Atlantis* 1 & 2 (online at sejh.pagesperso-orange.fr) accessed on 31 10 2015.

²¹ OLD-IRISH-L Archives Sat, 7 Jun 2014 22:50:18 (online at <https://listserv.heanet.ie/>) accessed on 31 10 2015

Noteworthy is that there is no disassociation within Gaulish calendar between the feast day associated with *Samain* and the month named for *Samain*. This is similar to Brythonic calendar's association of *hefen* with summer and which the start of would according to professor Hutton of a Brythonic feast of equivalent importance as the Irish feast of *Samain*.

Given this fact and that the Gaulish calendar pre-dates the Irish Christian calendar by approximately 700 years. It seems that the original position of the feast day of *Samain* occurred at the start of summer. And that at some point in the history of Goidelic Celt the feast of *Samain* was moved to the start of winter, causing the semantic shift in the use of *Samain*.

3. Semantic shift of Samain can be associated with the shift of All Saints Day.

eDil's definition of Samain identifies that within religious texts Samain means All Saints' Day.

"The first of November, the festival held on that date, in relig. contexts All Saints' Day, All Hallows."

This is not the only native term had been subjected to a semantic shift with introduction of Christianity. The Germanic languages use native words for the Christian feast drawn from the Hebrew *Pesah*, as in English we use Easter (Old English: *Ēastru*). Where as other languages use cognates of *Pesah*: Latin *pasch*, Greek *paskha*, Old French *Pasche*, Russian *Pásxa*, and Old Irish *Cásc*.

The earliest dateable text that gives a date for the celebration of *Samain* is the early 9th century religious text *Felire Oengusso*. It places *Samain* on November 1st:

"Lonán, Colmán, Cronán, cona cléir gil gríanaig: slúraig Helair deirb dálaig sórait samain síanaig,"

Translation:

"Lonán, Colmán, Cronán with their bright sunny following: the hosts of Hilarius sure multitudinous ennobled stormy All-Saints' day."²²

The entry in *Felire Oengusso* post-dates the existence of the celebration of All Saints' Day on November 1st, and hence its use of *Samain* cannot be separated from the pattern of other religious texts that use *Samain* for All Saints' Day:

For example:

The 12th century 'Félire hUa Gormáin' uses *Samna* for All Saints Day, in its entry for November 1st:

²² Whitley Stokes, *Félire Óengusso: The Martyrology of Oengus the Culdee*, Henry Bradshaw Society, Volume 29 (London 1905), 232.

“For sruithlo na samna in Commde fein feгаid, na hangeil drong diamair, ule noeim ind nime, sloigh co nglaine glegil, ma Maire moir miadaig, ... For in lith-sin Lonán, Cronán, Colmán coemseng, ...”

Translation:

“On the venerable day of Allhallowtide behold ye Lord Himself, the angels, a mystical band, and all the saints in heaven, hosts with clear white purity, around great honourable Mary, ... On that festival Lonán, Cronán, dear sleander Colmán, ...”²³

The *Annála Connacht*, in the year 1414, equates the VI Kalends November, “the sixth day before the November Kalends”, with the “sixth day before Samain”. Hence implying Samain is November 1st, i.e. All Saints’ Day.

“Conchabar mac Sefraid h. Flannacan damna taisig Clainni Cathail mortuus est vi. Calainn Nouimbir arai laithi mis greine, in uigilia Simionis & Jude, dia Sathairn arai laithi sechtmaine, an sesed la ria Samfuin e-sidein.”²⁴

Translation:

“Conchobar son of Sefraid O Flannacain, a possible chieftain of the Clann Chathail, died on the sixth of the Kalends of November by the day of the solar month, the vigil of SS. Simon and Jude, Saturday by the day of the week, the sixth day before Samain.”²⁵

The religious text ‘*Scél na samhna*’ states “Samhain is called Feast of All Saints”, and describes the origin story of All Martyrs’ Day, i.e., the original Christain feast that would later become All Saints’ Day:

“Conadh de sin do garar feria omnium s(an)ctorum don tsam(ain) .i. feria (“feil” written in margin here) nuili noebh ar adhr(a)d na nuili noem inti. Conidh he atb(er)aitseom gu nglantar tria aine na samhna gach aine loitter san bliá(dna) tria ain(m)fis no tria eici(n)taidh.”²⁶

Translation:

“And it is for that reason that Samhain is called Feast of All Saints, that is, Feast of All Saints because of adoration of all the saints on it. So that they say that every period of fasting which is violated in the year, through ignorance or necessity, is justified through the fast of Samhain.”²⁷

²³ Whitley Stokes, *The Martyrology of Gorman: Féilire hUa Gormáin*, Henry Bradshaw Society, Volume 9 (London 1895), 208

²⁴ Stokes, *The Martyrology of Gorman: Féilire hUa Gormáin*, 209

²⁵ *Annála Connacht* (online at <http://www.ucc.ie/celt/online/G100011/>) accessed on 31 10 2015

²⁶ *Annála Connacht* (online at <http://www.ucc.ie/celt/online/T100011/>) accessed on 31 10 2015

²⁷ OLD-IRISH-L Archives Sat, 7 Jun 2014 22:50:18 (online at <https://listserv.heanet.ie/>) accessed on 31 10 2015

The religious text “*Don tSamain Beoas*” makes the same statement, “Samhain is called Feast of All Saints”, with the same reference to the origin story of All Martyrs’ Day:

“Feria omnium sanctorum. Is e fath ara n-abar feria omnium sanctorum frisin samain.”

Translation:

“Feast of all saints. This is the principle according to which Samain is called Feast of all saints.”²⁸

And the same is true for the untranslated religious text ‘*Fagail na samna*’.

As for non-religious sources: there are two texts identified as matching *Felire Oengusso* in age, and which contain possible information as to when *Samain* occurred within the year.

They are the *Tochmach Emire* (though the section in question is missing from the earliest redaction) and *Scél asa mberar co mbad hé Find mac Cumaill Mongán*. Both place *Samain* in opposition of *Beltaine* and thus divide the year into two halves in the manner of Coligny calendar.

Tochmach Emire:

“Ar is dé roinn no bid for an m-pliadaín and .i. in samraid o beltine co samfuin & in gemred o samfuin co beltine.”²⁹

Translation:

“For two divisions were formerly on the year, viz., summer from Beltaine (the first of May), and winter from Samuin to Beltaine.”³⁰

Scél asa mberar co mbad hé Find mac Cumaill Mongán:

“Infed in fili scél cacha aidche do Mongán. Bá sí a chomsae a mboth samlaid ó samuin co béltaine.”³¹

²⁸ OLD-IRISH-L Archives Fri, 20 Dec 2013 13:08:29 (online at <https://listserv.heanet.ie/>) accessed on 31 10 2015

²⁹ Kuno Meyer, ‘Tochmarc Emire la Coinculaind’, *Zeitschrift für celtische Philologie* 3 (London – Paris 1901) (online at <http://www.ucc.ie/celt/published/G301021/>) accessed on 31 10 2015

³⁰ Kuno Meyer, ‘The Wooing of Emer’, *Archaeological Review*. volume 1, (London 1888) (online at <http://www.ucc.ie/celt/published/T301021/>) accessed on 31 10 2015

³¹ Richard Irvine Best, Osborn Bergin (ed), ‘Lebor na hUidre: the Book of the Dun Cow’, School of Celtic Studies, Dublin Institute for Advanced Studies (Dublin 1992) (online at <http://www.ucc.ie/celt/published/G301900/text039.html>) accessed on 31 10 2015

Translation:

“Every night the poet would recite a story to Mongan. So great was his lore that they were thus from Hallowe’en to May-day.”³²

However beginning in opposition to *Beltaine* offers limited information as to the actual position of *Samain*. For never text or concurrent sources define what day *Beltaine* actually occurred on.

Tochmach Emire does describe *Samain* as the start of winter and hence being concurrent with Christian doctrine that November 1st was the start of winter:

Regula Coenobialis of St Columban’s (540-615 CE):

“Rule 7: ... up to the beginning of winter, that is, the first of November.”³³

It seems probably that these non-religious texts, like the religious texts, place *Samain* on November 1st. Being that none of these texts can be proven to pre-date the introduction of All Saints Day on November 1st. It is probable that the Christian scribes of the non-religious texts used *Samain* in the same manner as the concurrent religious text *Felire Oengusso*, i.e. *Samain* as the Irish name for Christian celebration of All Saints Day.

As already shown the feast of *Samain* has been subject to a semantic moving is from *Cet Shamain* to *Gamain*. All Saints Day underwent such a shift, from the 13th day of *Cet Shamain* to the 1st day of *Gamain*. Hence the semantic shift of the feast of *Samain* to *Gamain* is a reflection of the semantic shift that affected the feast of All Saints’ Day.

A similar semantic shift can be seen in the Anglo-Saxon word ‘Allhallows’, which can be found as the name for All Martyrs Day. This is the presumed meaning in the early 10th century ‘Exeter Guild Statutes’, which refer to an assembly at Allhallows following Eastering:

“This association is assembled at Exeter, for the love of God and for our soul’s need, both in regard both the prosperity of our life and also to the days thereafter which we wish to be allotted to God’s Judgement. We have then agreed that our meeting shall take place three times in twelve months, once at Michaelmas, the second time at the feast of St. Mary after Christmas, the third time on All Saints after Easter.”³⁴

³² Kuno Meyer (ed), *The Voyage of Bran, Grimm Library 4* (New York 1895), 49

³³ G.S.M. Walker (ed), ‘Sancti Columbani Opera’, *Scriptores Latini Hiberniae* No. 2 (Dublin 1970) (online at www.ucc.ie/celt/online/T201052/) accessed on 31 10 2015

³⁴ Dorothy Whitelock, *English Historical Documents, 500-1042* (Psychology Press 1996), 605

Hence it is probably that *Samain* had to become associated with All Martyrs' Day, which coincided with the time of rise of Pleiades in Ovid's *Fasti* and hence the start of summer within the Roman calendar.

"PRID. ID MAI. PLEIADES RISE.
Behold the Pleiades, in conclave full
One night before the Idles, all visible.
Summer commences no, spring disappears,
So science, good authority ! declares"³⁵

That being prior All Martyrs' Day's move to the start of winter in the later 8th to early 9th century as All Saints' Day.

4. Evidence for the semantic shift being associated with transference of All Martyrs

The transference of All Martyrs (May 13th) to All Saints (November 1st) occurred in the later 8th century. This would have been after the introduction of the written records to Gaelic culture. Hence it is, even though no Irish manuscript survives from prior to the 8th century, that an echo of *Samain*'s original location has been transmitted to later documents.

The existence of this echo is shown in a number of ways:

a. Dr Binchy problem concerning *Samain*'s association with seed-time rituals.

"Professor Carney (Studies in E.I Literature, pp. 334 f.), who argues convincingly that in the light of the evidence collected by O'Rahilly the Feast of Tara as recorded in the annals, was the ancient ritual by which the kings of Tara were inaugurated. He also rightly stress the sexual connotation of the word *feis* (v.n. of *foiad*) in this symbolical mating of the king with the goddess; for this is the supreme fertility rite, designed to secure that man and beast and earth shall be fruitful throughout the king's dominions. Hence, despite the virtually uniform testimony of the later sources, it is unlikely to have any connexion with the festival of *Samain* and the dying year; on the contrary, one would expect it to be held, like similar rites the world over, at seed-time."³⁶

The simplest solution to the association of seed-time rituals with *Samain* is that it reflects the time prior to semantic shift of *Samain*.

The *Feis* of Tara itself can be associated with seed-time in two texts concerning the inauguration of the High King *Domnall mac Aed*, circa 628 AD. The first is *Fleadh duin na n-gedh, ocus tuait Catha muigi rath*, which starts with a description on how *Domnall mac Aed* builds a pseudo Tara at *Duin na n-gedh* near Dowth, related to the cursing of Tara by St. Ruadhan of Lothrae circa 565.

³⁵ John Benson Rose, *The Fasti of Ovid* (London 1866), 165

³⁶ Dr Daniel Binchy, 'Fair of Tairtiu and Feast of Tara', *Eriu* 18 (1955), 135

At this pseudo *Feis* of Tara, *Domnall mac Aed* requires goose eggs for the inauguration banquet:

“Ocus is é ro raid Domnall fri a mearu ocus fri a rechtairiu, ocus fri h-oes tobaig a chana ocus a chisa, ina bh-fuighbhedis a n-Erinn de uigib gédh do thabairt leo do chum na fleide sin, ...”³⁷

Translation:

“And Domhnall commanded his stewards and lawgivers, and the collector of his rents and tributes, to gather and bring to the feast all the goose eggs that could be found in Erin, ...”³⁸

However geese, like ducks and unlike hens, lay eggs seasonally. Geese eggs are only available in Ireland from February/March time to late as June.³⁹ Hence this pseudo *Feis* of Tara could only have occurred in late spring or early summer. Hence *Domnall mac Aed's* pseudo *Feis* of Tara conforms to Binchy and Carney's association of the *Feis* of Tara to springtime rituals.

The second text, the long version of "*The Battle of Magh Rath*" from the *Yellow Book of Lecan*, identifies the inauguration feast of *Domnall mac Aed* as occurring in the middle of the month of May (i.e. *Cet Shamain*) at the start of summer:

“Nir b'ingnad aimsear i n-inbasein ag h-ua Ainmirech, ór do h-urmaid sé saerighda, soineamhail, do'n ard-fhlaith ocus d'Erinn i comhrac re cheile: uair is e and so uair ocus aimsear, ocus ais eascan, ocus saer-laithi seachtmaine, in ro h-oirdned in t-ard-fhlaith, h-ua Ainmireach, i n-oirechus na h-Ereann, .i. i tinnsgeabal in treas cadair comhlaine do'n ogh-laithi aigeanta, i forbtha in darna h-uair déag dearrsgnaithi in chaem-laithi cedna, ocus i meadhon mír Mai, ocus ba Dia Domnaig daraithi a rai laithe seactmhaine, ocus in oll-cuiged beagh-aís eisgi ar sin.”⁴⁰

Translation:

“It was no wonder that the times were thus in the reign of the grandson of Ainmire, for the noble, happy prosperity of this monarch and of Erin were ordained together. For this was the hour, time, age of the moon, and day of the week, on which the grandson of Ainmire, the monarch, was inaugurated into the sovereignty of Erin, viz., in the beginning of the third quarter of the bright day, at the expiration of the twelfth hour of the same day, in the middle of the month of May, and as to the day of the week, it was on Sunday, and the great fifth was the auspicious age of the moon”⁴¹

³⁷ John O'Donovan, *The Banquet of Dun Na N-Gedh: And The Battle of Magh Rath* (Dublin 1842), 16

³⁸ O'Donovan, *The Banquet of Dun Na N-Gedh: And The Battle of Magh Rath*, 17

³⁹ Department of Agriculture, “Agriculture in Northern Ireland”, *Advisory Services* Volume 60 (March 1986), 374

⁴⁰ O'Donovan, *The Banquet of Dun Na N-Gedh: And The Battle of Magh Rath*, 106

⁴¹ O'Donovan, *The Banquet of Dun Na N-Gedh: And The Battle of Magh Rath*, 107

The tale's timing of the inauguration of *Domnall mac Aed* again conforms with the association of the Feis of Tara with *Cet Samain* and close to the day of All Martyrs.

b. The Second Echo is course of the Irish year.

The Gaulish month *Samonios* is the first month of *Coligny Calender* and is equivalent to Old Irish month of *Cet Shamain* (also called *Beltaine*). Given its relative position to the month of *Giamonios/Gamain*. Thus implying that *Cet Shamain* should be the first month of Goidelic calendar.

Within the early Irish law tracts *Cet Shamain* is the start of year for marriage and business contracts:

The law tract on marriage, *Cáin Lánamna*, describes a year's marriage ending at *Beltaine*:

"Nomad a indud, ocus a arbim, ocus a saill mad mardentaig; is miach di cacha mis ara bi co ceand mbliadna, .i. cus na belltanaib bida nesom; ar mu biad I naimsir imscarta iscarad."

Commentary: "... Cur na belltanaib, .i. uair is ann bu doigh imsacr doib. Dida nesom .i. fir bis a comfocus doib. I naimsir imscarta, .i. is in re suthain a netarscarad a nimsear."⁴²

Translation:

"One-ninth of his increase (the man's), and of his corn and of his bacon is due to the woman if she be a great worker; she has a sack every month she is with him to the end of a year, i.e. to the next May days, for this is mostly the time in which they make their separation."

Commentary: "... To the next May-days, i.e. because they are then likely to separate. The next, i.e., that are the very next to them. The time in which they make their separation, i.e., it is at that particular time they make separation."⁴³

A commentary from another law tract within *Cáin Lánamna* confirms that Irish marriages ran from *Beltaine* to *Beltaine*:

"Frithgnam erraig fri har ocus cridh; da trian a dligid na mna as."

Commentary: "... Ben in .ix. dia lectar i mbelltine, is da triain inomaid beres; ben in ogmair, is trian in nomaid; ben in samradh is trian trin nomaid disige; ben in geimrid, is trian mna cenmad rained .lxxx. di."⁴⁴

Translation:

⁴² *Senchus Mor, Part II, Ancient Laws of Ireland Volume 2* (Dublin - London 1869), 390

⁴³ *Senchus Mor, Part II, Ancient Laws of Ireland Volume 2*, 391

⁴⁴ *Senchus Mor, Part II, Ancient Laws of Ireland Volume 2*, 370

“As to the amount due for the service of Spring in ploughing and fattening; the right of the woman out of it is two-thirds.”

Commentary: “... If the woman entitled to one-ninth be put away in May, she shall obtain [at Spring] two-thirds of one-ninth; the woman put away in the Harvest time, gets one-third of the ninth; the woman put away in the Summer, one-third of the third of the ninth; the woman put away in Winter is entitled to one-third after that one-eighty-first part.”⁴⁵

The wife receives the following depending when she is ‘put away’:

1/81 if ‘put away’ in Summer, i.e., one-third of the third of the ninth
3/81 if ‘put away’ in Harvest, i.e., one-third of the ninth
4/81 if ‘put away’ in Winter, i.e., one-third [of one-ninth] after that one-eighty-first part
6/81 if ‘put away’ in Spring, i.e., two-thirds of one-ninth
9/81 if ‘put away’ in *Beltaine*, i.e., one-ninth

If the wife is put away in *Beltaine* she receives the highest award. The lowest award is for summer, implying the marriages ran from *Beltaine* to *Beltaine*.

A law tract within the *Book of Aicill* describes a business contract as running from *Beltaine* to *Beltaine*:

“.i. in foltach fuithrime ocus in carpat ar Imran ir é a naichmeside: tír ceithri secht cumhal ac in dara de, ocus ceithri ba fichit ac araile, ocus comaenta do niat ó belltaine co belltaine.”⁴⁶

Translation:

“That is, the ‘foltach fuithrime’-holder and the ‘carpat ar imramh’-stock-owner are of this king; the one has land of the value of four times seven ‘cumbals,’ and the other has twenty-four cows, and they make an agreement to remain together from May to May.”⁴⁷

The Gaulish month *Samonios* is also the cognate of *Samain*, hence if there was an old Irish month of *Samain* then it should have been start of the year.

The Annals of the Four Masters, in the year 3656, say that the feast day of *Samain* was the ‘end of the year’, i.e. the start of the next year:

FM 3656:

“... A b-foirchend na bliadhna-so at-bail-siomh, go teoraibh cethramhnaibh fer n-Ereann ime, i mordhail Maighe Slecht, isin m-Breifne ag adhradh do Crom Croach, airdiodhal

⁴⁵ *Senchus Mor, Part II*, Ancient Laws of Ireland Volume 2 (Dublin - London 1869), 371

⁴⁶ *The Book of Achill*, Ancient Laws of Ireland Volume 3 (Dublin - London 1873), 142

⁴⁷ *The Book of Achill*, Ancient Laws of Ireland Volume 3 (Dublin - London 1873), 143

adhartha Erenn eisidhe, oidche h-Samhna do h-sonradh innsin. As do na sleachtanaibh doronsat fir Erionn im Tighernmas h-isuidhe ro h-ainmnigheadh an magh.”⁴⁸

Translation:

“... At the end of this year he died, with the three fourths of the men of Ireland about him, at the meeting of Magh Slecht, in Breifne, at the worshipping of Crom Cruach, which was the chief idol of adoration in Ireland. This happened on the night of Samhain precisely. It was from the genuflections which the men of Ireland made about Tighearnmas here that the plain was named.”⁴⁹

Given that there is no Goidelic material that justifies that November 1st as being the end/start of the year. And that the the law tracts repeatedly identifies *Cet Shamain* (i.e. *Beltaine*) as the end/start of the contractual year. The simplest solution is that Four Masters use of *Samain* as the end/start of the year is an Echo of *Samain's* previous position as *Cet Shamain*.

c. *The Third Echo is then Samain is used for Cet Shamain:*

A Folk custom found across Europe requires at the start of summer that the forces of summer defeat the forces of winter. The first reference to such a custom within Europe was Olaus Magnus's 1555 description of Swedish and Goth May-day customs, where a mock battle was fought by men representing the victorious forces of summer and other as the forces of winter. Sir James Frazer noted similar mock battles occurring in century Palatinate and Bavaria in nineteenth century on the fourth Sunday in Lent. He also reported similar customs occurring in Lower Austria, on Shrove Tuesday, and in Brunswick.⁵⁰ William Hone also in the nineteenth century reported that on the 4th Sunday of Lent English boys performed mock battles where the forces of summer/spring defeated winter.⁵¹

As within Germanic culture the same custom was found within Celtic lands, with May the start of summer (*Cet Shamain*) being a time of battle:

“An aged Welshman described the battle as conducted in South Wales in the following way: “When I was a boy, two companies of men and youths were formed. One had for its captain a man dressed in a long coat much trimmed with fur, and on his head a rough fur cap. He carried a stout stick of blackthorn and a kind of shield, on which were studded tufts of wool to represent snow. His companions wore caps and waistcoats of fur decorated with balls of white wool. These men were very bold, and in songs and verse proclaimed the virtues of Winter, who was their captain. The other company had for its leader a captain representing Summer. This man was dressed in a king of white smock decorated with garlands of flowers

⁴⁸ John O'Donovan (ed), *Annala Rioghachta Eireann: Annals of the kingdom of Ireland by the Four Masters, Volume 1* (Dublin 1848) (online at <http://www.ucc.ie/celt/online/G100005A/>) accessed on 31 10 2015

⁴⁹ O'Donovan (ed), *Annala Rioghachta Eireann: Annals of the kingdom of Ireland by the Four Masters, Volume 1*

⁵⁰ Sir James G. Frazer, *The Golden Bough: A Study in Magic and Religion, Volume 4* (London 1912), 257

⁵¹ William Hone, *The Every-day Book and Table Book, Volume 1* (London 1826), 359.

and gay ribbons. On his head he wore a broad-brimmed hat trimmed with flowers and ribbons. In his hand he carried a willow-wand wreathed with spring flowers and tied with ribbons. All these men marched in procession, with their captains on horseback heading them, to an appropriate place. This would be on some stretch of common or wasteland. There a mock encounter took place, the Winter company flinging straw and dry underwood at their opponents, who used as their weapons birch branches, willow-wands, and young ferns. A good deal of horse-play went on, but finally Summer gained the mastery over Winter. Then the victorious captain representing Summer selected a May King and the people nominated a May Queen, who were crowned and conducted into the village. The remainder of the day was given up to feasting, dancing, games of all kinds, and later still, drinking. Revelry continued through the night until the next morning.”⁵²

The timing of this Maytime conflict between winter and summer corresponds with the timing of the endless battle between the bride stealing *Gwynn ap Nudd* and her suitor *Gwythyr ap Greidawl*, found in the *Mabinogan* tale of *Culhwch and Olwen*:

“A little while before this, Creiddylad the daughter of Lludd Llaw Ereint, and Gwythyr the son of Greidawl, were betrothed. And before she had become his bride, Gwyn ap Nudd came and carried her away by force; and Gwythyr the son of Greidawl gathered his host together, and went to fight with Gwyn ap Nudd. But Gwyn overcame him, and captured Greid the son of Eri, and Glinneu the son of Taran, and Gwrgwst Ledlwm, and Dynvarth his son. And he captured Penn the son of Nethawg, and Nwython, and Kyledyr Wyllt his son. And they slew Nwython, and took out his heart, and constrained Kyledyr to eat the heart of his father. And therefrom Kyledyr became mad. When Arthur heard of this, he went to the North, and summoned Gwyn ap Nudd before him, and set free the nobles whom he had put in prison, and made peace between Gwyn ap Nudd and Gwythyr the son of Greidawl. And this was the peace that was made :—that the maiden should remain in her father's house, without advantage to either of them, and that Gwyn ap Nudd and Gwythyr the son of Greidawl should fight for her every first of May, from thenceforth until the day of doom, and that whichever of them should then be conqueror should have the maiden.”⁵³

In the Gaelic speaking world the same custom appears in the Maytime battle between the forces of summer and winter as observed at start of the 18th century on the Isle of Mann:

George Waldron writing in 1726: “... ‘In almost all the great parishes they choose from among the daughters of the most wealthy farmers a young maid for the Queen of May. She is dressed in the gayest and best manner they can, and is attended by about twenty others, who are called maids of honour, she has also a young man, who is her captain, and has under his command a great number of inferior officers. In opposition to her is the Queen of Winter, who is a man dressed in women's clothes, with woollen hoods, fur tippets, and loaded with the warmest and heaviest habits one upon another; in the same manner are those who represent her attendants dressed; nor is she without a captain and troop for her defence. Both being equipped as proper emblems of the beauty of the spring and the deformity of the winter, they set forth from their respective quarters; the one preceded by violins and flutes, the other with the rough music of tongs and cleavers. Both companies

⁵² Marie Trevelyan, *Folk-lore and folk-stories of Wales* (London 1909), 25-6

⁵³ Lady Charlotte Guest, *The Mabinogion from the Llyfr Coch O Hergest, Volume II* (London 1840), 305

march till they meet on a common, and then their trains engage in a mock-battle. If the Queen of Winter's forces get the better, so far as to take the Queen of May prisoner, she is ransomed for as much as pays the expense of the day. After this ceremony, Winter and her company retire and divert themselves in a barn, and the others remain on the green, where, having danced a considerable time, they conclude the evening with a feast, the queen at one table with her maids, the captain with his troop at another. There are seldom less than fifty or sixty persons at each board.' ..."⁵⁴

The Manx custom of the May Queen defeating the Queen of Winter corresponds to the Scottish folk-stories of the *Cailleach*, representing winter, being defeated at the start of summer by the hero of the spring maiden:

K. W. Grant recorded this tradition in Argyll: "The sphere of the Cailleach's influence, and the actions attributed to her are the following: -

With her mallet - 'farachan' - or pestle - 'slachdan' - she beats and pounds the earth till all growth is destroyed; Nature has become torpid.

But about the middle of January Nature shows signs of reviving, and the sun has begun his returning journey. The Cailleach gets alarmed, and summons the 'faoiltich,' wolfings, or wolf-storms; 'faol,' a wolf. Those storms last until the middle of February.

Then follows the third week of February - 'trì lathan gobaig,' three days of 'shark-toothed,' bitter, stinging east winds; and 'trì lathan feadaig,' three days of 'plover-winged,' swift, fitful blasts, careering, rainy winds that are 'the death of sheep and lamb, and get the strong cattle bogged till the flood rolls over their heads.'

Here are the Gaelic words for those last lines.

'S mise 'n fheadag luirigineach luath;
Marbhaidh mi 'chaora, marbhaidh mi 'n t-uan;
Cuiridh mi a' bho' mhòr 's an toll
Gus am bi an tonn thar a ceann.

Then comes the last week of the month, 'Seachdain a' Ghearrain.' The name is variously interpreted. Some have supposed it to mean a week of sighing, moaning winds, from 'gearan,' complaining. Others take it to denote 'Ploughing Week,' from 'gearran,' a colt. A third party surmise that the name comes from 'geàrr-shion,' short, sudden squalls. But those who suggest this rendering place the week between the 15th of March and the 11th of April. Ploughing week is probably the true interpretation.

The first week of March is marked by temporary blasts of foul weather and flying showers - 'Sgarraichean na Feill Connain' - St. Conan Storms. The second week is marked by tempestuous weather, squally and inclement, 'Doirionn na Feill Padruig' - St. Patrick gales.

Then the Cailleach becomes desperate over her want of success. Despite her efforts to keep the earth hard by beating it with her mallet, despite her storming, the grass waxes, buds appear, and the blossoms peep from beneath their hoods. The Cailleach exclaims

Dh'fhàg e shìos mi, dh'fhàg e shuas mi;
Dh'fhàg e eadar mo dhà chluais mi;
Dh'fhàg e thall mi, dh'fhàg e bhos mi;

⁵⁴ Arthur William Moore, *The folk-lore of the Isle of Man* (1891), 111-2

Dh'fhàg e eadar mo dhà chois mi!

Shootings here and sprouting there,
It eludes me everywhere;
Overhead and underfoot
Bud and blade blossom shoot.

The brave, little wild duck taunts the Cailleach - "Despite thy shrivelling, stinging-cold little March, I and my twelve are yet alive!' 'Just wait a little!' exclaims March, or the Cailleach - for here they are synonymous; she borrows three days from February, and the result is thus described in Scotch: -

The first day it was win' an' west,
The neist day it was snaw an' sleet,
The third day it sae hard did freeze,
The wee birds nebs stuck tae the trees.

The Cailleach tries to chase away her son – the sun, wooing the young Spring – but he escapes with his bride. She causes the wild duck and her brood to perish with cold, and in so doing puts out her own eye. Baffled and defeated on every hand, and fleeing before her enemies, the wintry storms of the Cailleach sink into a calm as the returning sun shines forth and the warm winds blow.

The enraged Cailleach is defeated, she flings her mallet under a holly, where never a blade of grass can grow thereafter, so powerful is the magic influence to deaden growth.

This brings us to 'Latha na Caillich' – Old Wife's Day – the 25th day of March (old style), the date of the Cailleach's overthrow, the flinging down of her mallet, and her punishment in being turned into stone."⁵⁵

Donald Mackenzie gives readable account of this struggle between the *Cailleach*, the Maiden and her hero in his tale *The Coming of Angus and Bride*. Again the *Cailleach* holds *Bride* captive for fear of the coming summer and she is in turn rescued by *Angus Og* who has returned from the Green Isle, i.e., the otherworld:

"the wild winter season was going past, and that the reign of Queen Beira would soon come to an end."

Now the reason why Beira kept *Bride* a prisoner was because her fairest and dearest son, whose name was *Angus-the-Ever-Young*, had fallen in love with her. He was called 'the Ever Young' because age never came near him, and all winter long he lived on the Green Isle of the West, which is also called the 'Land of Youth.'

Angus first beheld *Bride* in a dream, and when he awoke he spoke to the King of the Green Isle,

...

A great feast was held in the palace of the Fairy Queen, and it was the marriage feast of *Bride*, for *Angus* and she were wed. The fairies danced and sang with joy, and all the world

⁵⁵ K. W. Grant, *Myth, Tradition and Story from Western Argyll* (1925), 5-6.

was moved to dance and sing with them. This was how the first 'Festival of Bride' came to be.

'Spring has come!' the shepherds cried; and they drove their flocks on to the moors, where they were counted and blessed.

...

Beira's reign was now drawing to a close. She found herself unable to combat any longer against the power of the new life that was rising in every vein of the land. The weakness of extreme old age crept upon her, and she longed once again to drink of the waters of the Well of Youth. When, on a bright March morning, she beheld Angus riding over the hills on his white steed, scattering her fierce hag servants before him, she fled away in despair. Ere she went she threw her magic hammer beneath a holly tree, and that is the reason why no grass grows under the holly trees.

...

On that day which is of equal length with the night, Angus came to Scotland with Bride, and they were hailed as king and queen of the unseen beings. They rode from south to north in the morning and forenoon, and from north to south in the afternoon and evening. A gentle wind went with them, blowing towards the north from dawn till midday, and towards the south from midday till sunset.

It was on that day that Bride dipped her fair white hands in the high rivers and lochs which still retained ice. When she did so, the Ice Hag fell into a deep sleep from which she could not awake until summer and autumn were over and past.

The grass grew quickly after Angus began to reign as king. Seeds were sown, and the people called on Bride to grant them a good harvest. Ere long the whole land was made beautiful with spring flowers of every hue.

...

In the old days, when there was no Calendar in Scotland, the people named the various periods of winter and spring, storm and calm, as they are given above. The story of the struggle between Angus and Beira is the story of the struggle between spring and winter, growth and decay, light and darkness, and warmth and cold."⁵⁶

The timing of the Gaelic tradition of the struggle between summer and winter matches the Germanic and Welsh tradition. However the Gaelic tradition is different in that the antagonists are lead by women, i.e., the *Cailleach* and Maiden/Bride.

However Irish texts that describe this battle between *Cailleach* and Maiden place the events at *Samain*:

Scél na samhna from the *Leabhar Breac*:

⁵⁶ Donald A. Mackenzie, *Wonder Tales from Scottish Myth and Legend* (1917), 33-48.

“Táinic dano bonefacius isin noen(a)ch iar sin 7 atconnairc rét ingn(a)d con ócb(aid) romhan(ach), .i. fithcheall do chnáimh elifannti et(er)ra ar mhedon na sreatha uirre ix. líne innti, a leth fhoirenn d'ór 7 an leth naill d'aircet. Dealbh bhan for lethfhoirinn dibh 7 écasc fer for in lethfhoirinn naili, dias oca himert .i. cailleach dhubh diucartech aidhthi gun aigh(aidh) {g}námh(e)c fhodbronnach co ngnúis (??) nai naindren(n)tai co nailgibh (??) (??) Ingen og isin {leth} naill. (??) gnúis caeim c(ro)t min m(??) rosc glas gleordha le, bel derg tana na bui ecc na ainimh o rinn cu bonn indti. Is aml(aid) {dano} bai in fhithcheall sin cona sreathaibh findruine 7 leaccab innti. Tancat(ar) ind ocb(aid) roman(ac)h dia (??) annside 7 bat(ar) foir(enn) dibh oc greasacht na cailli(ge) 7 foir(enn) ele ic greasacht na hingine óigi do imert an aigh(aid) na caill(ige). Cur an chaill(ech) laimh ina sliasaid do taraing nai mbiasdai adhuathmara urgrana amach 7 dog(re)ss fon slóg iat (??) eitacht. Do tairing an oicben dano la greasacht na forne aili nai nogha cruth(a)ca asa beolu 7 lot(air) a nag(aid) na mbiasd 7 ro chath(aig)set friu 7 ní ro ans(a)t dib gur chuirs(e)t for neifní iat 7 ro f(ac)bhadh an ced aen(ach) fon ninnus sin. Bat(ar) dano ind ocbh(aid) romhan(a)ch ag greasacht na calli(ge) um aen(ach) aili d'ferthain an ainm na ríгна. Rolai in caill(each) braen asa braguit annsin for leth na forne gu derna secht leom(ain) shonairt dhib, 7 ro shuidhigh a rinn tuaiscertaigh na fitcle iat ar is a rinn deiscirtai na f(idcille) bui in óg. Batar dano ind fairenn aili oc greasacht na hoigh um fhreasdal na calli(ge). Rolai side duno brae(n) forsín leth foir(enn) aili co nderna secht nuana geala dib {n}adharcuibh ordhaibh foruibh. 19 Rochath(aig)set du(no) co foechair na huai(n) 7 na leom(ain) con ?sat for neifni. Rolai din in chaili(ch) b{roend?} forsín leth fhoirinn doridhisi con nderna dhraic nadhuathmhair ndermhair dhi. Rolai du(no) in ogh bricht for an leth fhoir(enn) aili co nderna reithi corcra di co cetra cosaibh aircit fai co natarcaib oir fair. Rocath(aig)set iarum in draic 7 in reithe 7 romhenbhaidh 7 rochuir for nefni.”

Translation:

“After that, moreover, Boniface came to the fair and saw a strange thing with a group of Roman youths i.e. a fidchell-board of ivory between them. In the middle of the rows on it (there were) nine lines on it, half its set of pieces of gold and the other half of silver. The shape of women on one half set of them, and the look of men on the other half set. Two people playing it, that is, a dark forlorn? old woman (??), having a blemished face, long-bellied with a fierce (??) visage with keen eyebrows, with fiery forehead-tops?. A young girl on the other {side}. (??) She has a fair face, a gentle face of proper fineness,(??) bright green eyes, thin red mouth. There was not {a sign of} death nor a blemish from the top of her head to the sole of her foot on her. Then this is how the fidchell board was, with its white lines and slabs. The group of Roman youths came to (??) there, and a team of them were goading the old woman, and another team egging on the young woman to play against the old woman.

The old woman put a hand in her thigh and drew out nine terrible, very ugly monsters and set them upon the throng (??) fleeing. With the urging of the other team, the young woman then drew nine beautiful virgins from her mouth and they ripped against the beasts and fought against them and they did not give up until they brought them to nought and the first fair was finished in that manner. Then the Roman youths were provoking the old woman at another fair, out of helping in the name of the queen. The old woman cast a shower out of her throat then upon half the set which made seven strong lions out of them, and she sat them at the northern edge of the fidchell board because the virgin was at the southern edge of the (fidchell board). Then the other team were egging on the virgin to serve the old woman. She then cast a shower on the other half set and made seven white lambs out of them with golden horns upon them. Then the lambs and the lions fought fiercely until they

were turned into nothing. The old woman then cast a {spell} on the half set again and made it into a huge terrible dragon. Then the virgin cast a spell on the other half set and made it into a purple ram with four silver feet beneath it, with horns of gold upon it. Then the dragon and the ram fought and he smashed into bits and annihilated (him)."⁵⁷

And in *Don tSamain Beas* from the *Leabhar Breac*:

"Fáth aile beos and .i. cluiche no gnáthaigtis gille na Romanach cecha bliadna isin ló sin. .i. fidchell co n-delb challige isindala cind 7 delb ingine óige isin chind aile. Colléced in chaillech uathi draicc d'indsaigid na hingine tria thogairm n-demna doib-sium, 7 con léced an ingen uan uathi don leth aile for amus na draicce conus fortamlaiged in t-uan forsin draicc. Doléced in chaillech iarum leoman do shaigid na hingine 7 nos léced an ingen rethe for amus in leomain 7 uincebat aries leonam. Co tarla in Bonifatius cetna cusin cluiche conepert friu co m-ba hecoir dóib in fhuirseoracht 7 cor iarfaid (read - faig) dib, canas a fhuaratar a cluiche. Atbertsat na gille: "Sibill .i. banfháid togaide bóí sund o chéin mair" ol iat, "isí ro fhácaib occaínd in cluiche si tria rath fháitsine oc tairchetul Crist 7 diabuil." "Deo gratias" ol e-sium. "Tanic chena inti ro terchanad ann", ol se "7 ro fortamlaiged for diabuil." "Berid-siu bendachtu" ol se " 7 na denaid hé ní bus mó." Tairmischther andsin in cluiche si dognítis homnes pueri Romanorum isin samain cecha bliadna."⁵⁸

Translation:

"Another reason exists namely, the games played by Roman youths every year on that day. viz., a chess-set, with one side shaped as an old woman, the other as a young girl. The old woman released a dragon against the young girl by summoning demons to them and the girl would turn loose a lamb from the other side against the dragon and the lamb would prevail over the dragon. Then the old woman released a lion against the young girl and the young girl released a ram against the lion and [Latin:] the ram defeated the lion. That same Boniface happened upon the game, and said that the pantomime/play acting was not right/just for them, and he inquired of them whence they had found their game. The youth(s) said: [It was] Sybil, viz., the chosen prophetess who lived there of old, they say, it is she who left us this game by means of prophecy and foretelling about Christ and devil. Thank God, said he. The one who is prophesied in it has already come, said he, and overcome the Devil. Be ye blessed, said he, and do not do this thing anymore. This game was prohibit then, (which) all of the Roman youths would do in the Samain of every year."⁵⁹

Yet, there is no conflict between the Irish battle between *Cailleach* and Maiden at *Samain* and the Manx/Scottish tradition of the battle occurring at the start of summer. For the Irish text associate it with Pope Boniface's consecration of the Pantheon to All Martyrs on May 13th. The authors of these texts presumably assumed that *Samain* to be the Irish name for

⁵⁷ OLD-IRISH-L Archives Sat, 7 Jun 2014 22:50:18 (online at <https://listserv.heanet.ie/>) accessed on 31 10 2015

⁵⁸ Whitley Stokes, Ernst Windisch (eds), *Irische texte*, Leipzig 1894), 215

⁵⁹ OLD-IRISH-L Archives Fri, 20 Dec 2013 13:08:29 (online at <https://listserv.heanet.ie/>) accessed on 31 10 2015

All Martyrs Day, hence both Irish and Manx/Scottish traditions place the battle between *Cailleach* and Maiden at the start of summer.

Hence these two texts Samain is associated with *Cet Shamain*, supporting *Samain* as once at the start of summer and Gaelic year.

There is further Irish material that reflects the Scottish/Manx traditions with the *Cailleach* being defeated at start of summer by the Maiden.

Sentainne Béirri tells that *Cet Shamain* is a time of grief for the *Cailleach* of Beare and a time of joy for Maidens:

“Is mé Caillech Béirri, Buí;
no meilinn léini m-bithnúí;
in-dú táthum, dom séimi,
ná melainn cid aithléini.

...

It fáilti na ingena
ó thic dóib co Beltaine;
is deithbiriu dam-sa brón:
sech am tróg, am sentainne.

...

Sam óited i rrabamur
do-miult cona fhagamur;
gaim aís báides cech nduine
dom-ánaic a fhochmuine.

...”

Translation:

“ ...

I am Buí, the Old Woman of Beare;
I used to wear a smock that was ever-renewed;
today it has befallen me, by reason of my mean estate,
that I could not have even a cast-off smock to wear.”

...

The maidens are joyful
when they reach May-day;
grief is more fitting for me:
I am not only miserable, but an old woman.

...

Summer of youth in which we have been
I spent with its autumn;
winter of age which overwhelms everyone,
its first months have come to me.

...”⁶⁰

⁶⁰ Gerard Murphy (ed), *The Lament of the Old Woman of Beare in Early Irish lyrics, eighth to twelfth century*, (Oxford 1956) (online at <http://www.ucc.ie/research/celt/published/G400034/>) accessed on 31 10 2015

Youth (the maidens) is a metaphor for summer and old-age for winter (the *Cailleach*).

Cet Shamain is also the day then *Cailleach* of Beare's sister, the *Cailleach* of Connacht, dies. The month being described as 'glory of battle':

"Lia Nothain, canas rohainmni[g]edh? Ni ansa .i. Nothan cailleach di Chonnachtaib, & ni ruc a gnuiss riam for machairi o rogeinir, & batir lana tri coicait bliadan di. Doluid a siur fecht n-an[n] cuici dia hacallaim. Sentuinde a hainm, Sess Srafais a fer .i. Senbachlach ainm ele dó. Unde poeta dixit:

' Sentuinne ocus Senbachlach
rop seiss [s]rafaiss a crinfess,
acht nocon adrat Mac nDé
nocon fagbat a primless.'

A Berri dano lotar di[a] hindsaigidh, dia hidnacul for machairie dia cetamuin. O'tcondarc sí in mag mor uaidhi rofeimdes uaidi dul arculu, & roclann liic annsin hi talmuin, & benais a cenn fria conattuil imm & ba marb. 'Bid si mo ecnairc lasa muinntir asberim foclannaim do raith mo anma.' Unde Lia Nothain.

Nothan ingen Chonmair chain,
caillech cruaidh di Connachtaib,
a mis cetemuin, ngluair nglic,
is i fo[f]huair in ardlicc."⁶¹

Translation:

"Lia Nothain. – Nothain [was] an old woman of Connaught, and from the time she was born her face never fell on a field, and her thrice fifty years were complete. Her sister once went to have speech with her. Sentuinne was her name: her husband was Sess Srafais, and Senbachlach was another name for him. Hence said the poet:

'Sentuinne and Senbachlach,
A Seis Srofais be their withered hair!
If they adore not God's Son
They get not their chief benefit.'

From Berre, then, they went to her to bring her on a plain on May-day. When she beheld the great plain, she was unable to go back from it, and she planted a stone (lia) there in the ground, and struck her head against it and and was dead. 'It will be my requiem I plant it for sake of my name.' Whence Lia Nothan.

Nothain, daughter of Conmar the fair,
A hard old woman of Connaught,
In the month of May, glory of battle,

⁶¹ Whitley Stokes, 'The Bodleian Dinnshenchas', *Folklore* 3 (London 1892), 504

She found the high stone.”⁶²

In *Coir Anamm (H.3.18)*, *Cet Shamain* is associated with the transformation of the *Cailleach* into the Maiden. The radiance of *Cailleach*'s face in her new form as the Maiden, is described as 'the sun rising in the month of *Cet Shamain*':

“Luidh Lugaid Láighi fódheoidh. IS bert in chaillech in cétnai frís. ‘Oentudaid [fi]fet-sa frit’, or Lugaid. Luidh in chaillech isin tolc. & luidh Lugaid ina díh. INdar-lais bá grían ag turgbháil a mís Mháí soillsi a gnúisi. Fúan corcra corthorach, folt dath-alainn impi. Ba samháltá fri lughbort cumra a boladh. Teít ina gnaís iarum. ‘Maith do thurus’, or sí. ‘Missi in flaitheus, & gébhthar rige n-Erenn úait’.”⁶³

Translation:

“At last went Lugaid Láigde. The hag said the same to him. "I will sleep alone with thee", says Lugaid. The hag entered the bed, and Lugaid followed her. It seemed to him that the radiance of her face was the sun rising in the month of May. A purple, bordered gown she wore, and she had beautifully coloured hair. Her fragrance was likened to an odorous herb-garden. Then he mingled in love with her. "Auspicious is thy journey", quoth she. "I am the sovranty, and the kingship of Erin will be obtained by thee".⁶⁴

The Irish transformation of the *Cailleach* into a Maiden parallels the alternative Scottish tradition of the transformation of the *Cailleach* into the Maiden. This tradition is found within the two versions tale of *Loch Ba-I*,⁶⁵ where the *Cailleach* baths every hundred years to be transformed to her maiden form. And in the tale of *The Prattling Old Wife*, where *Chailleach Bearo* goes every seven years to a medicinal well to renew her youth.⁶⁶

The transformation of the *Cailleach* is physical performed yearly with corn dolls in both nations:

Scotland: “Then at the beginning of February, at the festival of Bride or Brigit, it was the custom in the Hebrides to take a sheaf from the previous year's harvest [i.e., known typically as the *Cailleach*], form it into a female figure, and carry it from house to house. This effigy was known as the Bride or little Bride. In some places, the older women of the townland would make her a cradle. These were similar in Ireland.”⁶⁷

Ireland: “Once cut, the *Cailleach* sheaf was treated reverently. Dressed as an old woman or plaited into a cross, it hung in house or barn until replaced by the next year's sheaf. In many

⁶² Stokes, ‘The Bodleian Dinnshenchas’, 504-5

⁶³ Whitley Stokes, Ernst Windisch (eds), *Irische texte* (Leipzig 1891), 320

⁶⁴ Stokes, Windisch (eds), *Irische texte* (1891), 321

⁶⁵ Gearoid O Cruailaich, *The Book of The Cailleach* (Cork University Press, 2003), 113-118

⁶⁶ Edward Bradley, *The white wife; with other stories, collected by Cuthbert Bede*, London 1865, 124-5

⁶⁷ Mary Low, *Celtic Christianity and nature: early Irish and Hebridean traditions*, Edinburgh University Press 1996, 126

areas, the Cailleach sheaf provided material for spring's Brigit crosses – the same hag-into-virgin motif we encounter in our tales of Niall visiting the well.”⁶⁸

5. The Counter argument: Lughnasad and the problem of Irish Folk Calendar

That *Samain* is one of Ireland's four quarter days within the Irish folk calendar. Has led to the argument that being so *Samain* is correct associated with the first day of winter, even though the etymology of Samain does not concur.

The earliest reference to the Irish folk calendar is found within the *Tochmarc Emire* and has been accepted as an echo of the Irish pre-Christian calendar. However there is no evidence that cross quarter days existed in Ireland prior to the arrival of Christianity. And Christians themselves used the same cross quarter days. For these cross quarter days were used in the Roman calendar to mark the beginning of the seasons. The Irish texts that record the Irish folk calendar are products of Christian writers and hence the simplest answer why the Irish cross quarter days reflects the Roman cross quarter days is that they are a product of Irish Christianity.

The folk calendar as it appears in *Tochmarc Emire*:

“An Benn Suain isrubart maic Roiscmilc, iss inond on sen .i. conrubar-sæ cin cotlud o shamuin, edhón sam-fuin .i. fuin an t-samraid ann. Ar is dé roinn no bid for an m-pliadaid and .i. in samraid o beltine co samfuin & in gemred o samfuin co beltine. Nó samsun .i. samsvan .i. is ann sin feraid sam svana .i. sam són. Co h-óimolcc .i. taiti and erraig i. imme-folc .i. folc ind erraig & folc in gemrid.’

‘Nó aimelc .i. u-melc. Oi issan éxi ainm ina cæirech, iss de isper oi-ba, ut dicitur coinba , echba, duineba, amol iss ainm do bas ba . Oimolc 'diu is h-i aimser inn sen a ticc as cæiriuch & i m-bleugaur coirich, unde oissc .i. oi-sesc .i. coeru seisc. Co beldine .i. bil-tine .i. tene soinnech .i. da tene do gnidiss la h-æss rechtai no druid co tincetlaib moraib & do lecdis na cethra etarrae ar tedmonnaib cecha bliadna. Nó co beldine 'diu, ainm de idail. is ann doaselti dine gacha ceathra for seilb Beil. Beldine iarum bel-dine, dine cecha cethrai. Co prón trogein .i. lughnasad .i. taide fogamuir .i. is and dobroine trogain .i. talom fo toirtip. Trogan didiu ainm do talvm .’⁶⁹

Translation:

“Bend Suain, son of Rosc Mele, which she said this is the same thing, viz., that I shall fight without harm to myself from Samuin, i.e., the end of summer. For two divisions were formerly on the year, viz., summer from Beltaine (the first of May), and winter from Samuin to Beltaine. Or sainfuin, viz., suain (sounds), for it is then that gentle voices sound, viz., sám-

⁶⁸ Patricia Monaghan, *The Red-Haired Girl from the Bog: The Landscape of Celtic Myth and Spirit* (New World Library 2010), 39

⁶⁹ Kuno Meyer, ‘Tochmarc Emire la Coinculaind’, *Zeitschrift für celtische Philologie* Volume 3 (London 1901), 245

son 'gentle sound'. To Oimolc, i.e., the beginning of spring, viz., different (ime) is its wet (folc), viz the wet of spring, and the wet of winter.

Or, oi-melc, viz., oi, in the language of poetry, is a name for sheep, whence oibá (sheep's death) is named, ut dicitur coinbá (dog's death), echbá (horse's death), duineba (men's death), as bath is a name for 'death'. Oi-melc, then, is the time in which the sheep come out and are milked, whence oisc (a ewe), i.e., oisc viz., barren sheep. To Beldine, i.e. Beltine, viz., a favouring fire. For the druids used to make two fires with great incantations, and to drive the cattle between them against the plagues, every year. Or to Beldin, viz., Bel the name of an idol. At that time the young of every neat were placed in the possession of Bel. Beldine, then Beltine. To Brón Trogaill, i.e. Lammas-day, viz., the beginning of autumn; for it is then the earth is afflicted, viz., the earth under fruit. Trogam is a name for 'earth.'"⁷⁰

These Irish cross quarter days have become associated with the dates of February 1st, May 1st, August 1st, and November 1st.

Bede writing before *Tochmarc Emire* shows the Church uses cross quarter days in the same months: February, May, August and November:

“But Greeks and Romans, whose authority on these matters, rather than that of Spaniards, it is generally preferable to follow, deem that winter begins on the 7th ides of November, spring on the 7th ides of February, summer on the 7th ides of May, and autumn on the 7th ides of August. Noting that summer and winter begin with the evening or morning of the rising and setting of the Pleiades, they place the commencement of spring and autumn when the Pleiades rise and set around the middle of the night. Then again in the finest and most authoritative books of the cosmographers, we find the same seasons clearly distinguished, with the rising of the Pleiades observed at the 7th ides of May and their setting at the 7th ides of November. And Pliny the Elder in the second book of his Natural History judges that they are to be divided in the same manner.”⁷¹

The season being on: February 7th, May 9th, August 7th and the November 7th, and Bede says they reflect the older Romans tradition. As can be found in the writings of Pliny and Varro:

Pliny, circa 77-9 AD:

“... The winter solstice begins at the eighth degree of Capricorn, the eighth day before the calends of January, in general; the vernal equinox at the eighth degree of Aries; the summer solstice, at the eighth degree of Cancer; and the autumnal equinox at the eighth degree of Libra: and it is rarely that these days do not respectively give some indication of a change in the weather.

These four seasons again, are subdivided, each of them, into two equal parts. Thus, for instance, between the summer solstice and the autumnal equinox, the setting of the Lyre, on the forty-sixth day, indicates the beginning of autumn; between the autumnal equinox and

⁷⁰ Kuno Meyer, 'The Wooing of Emer', *Archaeological Review*. Volume 1 (London 1888), 232

⁷¹ Faith Wallis, *Bede, The Reckoning of Time*, (Liverpool University Press 1999), 101-2

the winter solstice, the morning setting of the Vergiliæ [Pleiades], on the forty-fourth day, denotes the beginning of winter; between the winter solstice and the vernal equinox, the prevalence of the west winds on the forty-fifth day, denotes the commencement of spring; and between the vernal equinox and the summer solstice, the morning rising of the Vergiliæ [Pleiades], on the forty-eighth day, announces the commencement of summer."⁷²

Varro, circa 37 BC:

"The first day of spring occurs in Aquarius, that of summer when it is in Taurus, of autumn when it is in Leo, of winter when it is in Scorpio. As the twenty-third day of each one of these four signs is the first day of the four seasons, this makes spring contain 91 days, summer 94, autumn 91, winter 89, which numbers, reduced to the official calendar now in force, fix the beginning of spring on February 7, of summer on May 9, of autumn on August 11, of winter on November 10. But in the more exact divisions certain things are to be taken into account, which cause an eightfold division: the first from the rising of the west wind to the vernal equinox, 45 days, thence to the rising of the Pleiades 44 days, thence to the solstice 48 days, thence to the rising of the Dog Star 27 days, thence to the autumnal equinox 67 days, from there to the setting of the Pleiades 32 days, hence to the winter solstice 57 days, and back to the rising of the west wind 45 days."⁷³

The same cross quarter days used in Irish Christain texts existed in the Roman world five hundred years before the time of St. Patrick and eight hundred years before *Tochmarc Emire*. While *Tochmarc Emire* also tells of a different division of the year: "two divisions were formerly on the year", i.e., summer and winter, reflect the division of the year found within the Celtic *Coligny Calendar*. And by so the *Tochmarc Emir* implies that the four seasons of Irish folk calendar are a new division of the year. Hence Irish cross quarter day are likely Christain in origin.

The difference between the "Irish pre-Christain cross quarter day", February 1st, May 1st, August 1st, and November 1st, and those of the Romans, February 7th, May 9th, August 7th and the November 7th, is that in the Irish folk calendar to ermege chose the first day of the month. The earliest document to show this Irish pattern is the *Felire Oengusso* where *Samain* appears on November 1st, however this is due to its association with All Saints'/All Martyrs's day. The earliest importance placed on November 1st by an Irish document is the Hiberno-Frankish text *Regula Coenobialis of St Columban* (540-615 CE):

Rule 7:

"Hence, in agreement with our predecessors, from the twenty-fourth of June, while the night increases, the office begins to grow gradually from twelve chants of the shortest measure on

⁷² John Bostock, H.T. Riley, The Natural History of Pliny, Bohn's Classical Library, Volume 4, 79, 1856, 79

⁷³ De Re Rustica , Marcus Terentius Varro (Online at http://penelope.uchicago.edu/Thayer/E/Roman/Texts/Varro/de_Re_Rustica/1*.html) accessed on 31 10 2015

the night of the Sabbath or the Lord's Day, up to the beginning of winter, that is, the first of November."⁷⁴

However this Irish text is pre-dated by Rules of St. Benedict of Nursia, circa 530, which already identifies November 1st as the start of winter:

"CHAPTER 8 Of the Divine Office during the Night
Making due allowance for circumstances, the brethren will rise during the winter season, that is, from the calends of November till Easter, at the eighth hour of the night;"⁷⁵

Concurrent with Saint Columban was Saint Isidore of Seville (560-636 AD), who explains the biblical importance of November 1st:

"The fourth fast is on the first day of November, which testimony declares was either initiated or instituted by Jeremiah the prophet on divine authority ... In the ninth month ... '... a fast to placate the LORD was proclaimed for all the people of Jerusalem' (Jer 36:2-9)"⁷⁶

Within Jeremiah the ninth month, i.e., November ('ninth month') is identified as the start of winter:

Jer 36:22: "Now the king sat in the winterhouse in the ninth month ..."

Then it is likely that Romans are the source of the months, Christian theology in regard to importance of November 1st as the start of winter resulted in the movement of cross quarter days to the beginning of the months.

If the dates within the Irish folk calendar cannot be trusted, does the etymology or native descriptions of the feasts provide a clue to then they where performed in the year?

a. Samain

As already dicussed the date of celebration of Samain original moved from May and has no originally association with November 1st prior to the end of the 8th century.

b. Oimolc

Not enough information is available at this time to evalulate Oimolc.

c. Beltaine

⁷⁴ Monks' Rules, Columbanus Hibernus (online at www.ucc.ie/celt/online/T201052/) accessed on 31 10 2015

⁷⁵ Rev. Boniface Verheyen, *The Holy Rule of St. Benedict*, 1949

⁷⁶ Thomas Louis Knoebel, *Isidore of Seville: De Ecclesiasticis Officiis*, Paulist Press 2008, 62-3

The earliest reference to calendar date for *Beltaine* is found in the second redaction of *Lebor Gabála Éirenn*:

“There came a plague upon them on the kalends of May, the Monday of Beltaine; ...”⁷⁷

The earliest reference with general calendar information for the timing of *Beltaine* is found within *Tochmach Emire* and *Scél asa mberar co mbad hé Find mac Cumail Mongán*. They place *Beltaine* at the start of summer, in opposition to *Samain*. However this cannot be taken with certainty to mean the date of May 1st.

The start of summer was originally the time of *Samain* and hence *Beltaine* as semantically replaced *Shamain*. Therefore *Beltaine* cannot be thought of as the original name for this celebration at the start of summer. *Beltaine* could have been part of the custom of *Samain* celebration and hence not transferred to the start of winter, or possibly it was a name transferred from another custom held elsewhere in the year.

The etymology of *Beltaine*, ‘Fire of Bel’, provides little information as to its original origin prior to becoming a synonym for *Cet Shamain* (i.e. *Samain*).

The oldest descriptions of the custom of *Beltaine* describe it as form of baptism by fire:

Sanas Cormaic⁷⁸

B “Belltaine .i. bil tene .i. tene soinmech .i. dáthene dognítis druidhe tria thaircedlu († cotinchetlaib) móraib combertis na cethrai arthedmannaib cacha bliadna cusnaténdtibsín” (MARG-“Leictis na cethra etarru”).

Y “Belltaine .i. beil-tine .i. tene bil .i. da tene soinmech dognitis na draithe co tincetlaib moraib foraib 7 doberdis na cetra etarro ar tedmanduib cecha bliadna.

Translation:

“Belltaine, ... i.e., bil-tene, i.e. lucky fire, i.e. two fires which Druids used to make with great incantations, and they used to bring the cattle [as safeguard] against the diseases of each year to those fires [in marg.] they used to drive the cattle between them.”⁷⁹

And in *Tochmach Emire*:

“co beldine .i. bil-tine .i. tene soinmech .i. da tene do gnidiss la h-æss rechtaí no druid co tincetlaib moraib & do lecdís na cethra etarræ ar tedmonnaib cecha bliadna.

⁷⁷ R. A. Stewart Macalister, *Lebor gabála Éirenn: The book of the taking of Ireland*, Irish Text Society Volume 3 (Dublin University Press 1940), 21

⁷⁸ Early Irish Glossaries Database (online at <http://www.asnc.cam.ac.uk/irishglossaries/>) accessed on 31 10 2015

⁷⁹ Whitley Stokes, Sanas Cormac: *Cormac's glossary, translated and annotated by late John O'Donovan LL.D.*, (Calcutta 1868), 19

Nó co beldine 'diu, ainm de idail. is ann doaselbti dine gacha ceathra for seilb Beil. Beldine iarum bel-dine, dine cecha cethrai.”⁸⁰

Translation:

“To Beldine, i.e. fire of Bil, viz., a lucky fire, i.e. two fires make with h-aess ruler or the druids used to make two fires with great incantations, and to drive the cattle between them against the plagues, every year. Or else until Beldine, the name of an idol. It is then that a “dine” [the newly born?] of every livestock would be given over into the possession of Bel. Beldine accordingly bel-dine, a “dine” [the newly born?] of each livestock.”⁸¹

As opposed to *Cet shamain* which was the being the start of summer:

Sanas Cormaic

M “Cetsámon .i. cet samsin .i. ceclud sine samraig”
Y “Cetsámun .i. cet-šam-sin .i. ceclud sine samhraidh”⁸²

Translation:

“Cetsoman i.e. cét-sam-sín, i.e. the first motion of the weather of summer.”

The description as the fire of Bel conjures images of the fire of Baal from the Old Testament:

"In early scripture history, we read that the people not only passed their cattle, but their children, through the idolatrous fires of Baal and Moloch"⁸³

As in:

Jeremiah 19:5: “5 They have built the high places of Baal to burn their children in the fire as offerings to Baal—something I did not command or mention, nor did it enter my mind.”

Jeremiah 32:35: “35 And they built the high places of Baal, which are in the valley of the son of Hinnom, to cause their sons and their daughters to pass through the fire unto Molech;

⁸⁰ Kuno Meyer, ‘Tochmarc Emire la Coinculaind, *Zeitschrift für celtische Philologie* 3 (London – Paris 1901) (online at <http://www.ucc.ie/celt/published/G301021/>) accessed on 31 10 2015

⁸¹ Kuno Meyer, ‘The Wooing of Emer’, *Archaeological Review*. volume 1, (London 1888) (online at <http://www.ucc.ie/celt/published/T301021/>) accessed on 31 10 2015

⁸² Early Irish Glossaries Database (online at <http://www.asnc.cam.ac.uk/irishglossaries/>) accessed on 31 10 2015

⁸³ Jonathan F. Slingsby, Irish Popular Superstitions, *The Dublin University Magazine*, Number 209, Volume 35, May 1850, 543

which I commanded them not, neither came it into my mind, that they should do this abomination, to cause Judah to sin.”

2 Kings 23: “9 Nevertheless the priests of the high places came not up to the altar of the LORD in Jerusalem, but they did eat of the unleavened bread among their brethren. 10 And he defiled Topheth, which is in the valley of the children of Hinnom, that no man might make his son or his daughter to pass through the fire to Molech. 11 And he took away the horses that the kings of Judah had given to the sun, at the entering in of the house of the LORD, by the chamber of Nathanmelech the chamberlain, which was in the suburbs, and burned the chariots of the sun with fire.”

Leviticus 18:21: “21 And thou shalt not let any of thy seed pass through the fire to Molech, neither shalt thou profane the name of thy God: I am the LORD.”

Leviticus 20:1-5: “20 The Lord said to Moses, 2 “Say to the Israelites: ‘Any Israelite or any foreigner residing in Israel who sacrifices any of his children to Molek is to be put to death. The members of the community are to stone him. 3 I myself will set my face against him and will cut him off from his people; for by sacrificing his children to Molek, he has defiled my sanctuary and profaned my holy name. 4 If the members of the community close their eyes when that man sacrifices one of his children to Molek and if they fail to put him to death, 5 I myself will set my face against him and his family and will cut them off from their people together with all who follow him in prostituting themselves to Molek.”

The “fire of Bel” is close in concept of the “fire of *Baal*” and hence is potentially Christian in origin.

Another question is whether the “fire of Bel” was only lit at the start of summer. For 18th century folk traditions of Ireland and Scotland match the description described for Beltaine:

“To Beldine, i.e. fire of Bil, viz., a lucky fire, i.e. two fires made with h-aess ruler or the druids used to make two fires with great incantations, and to drive the cattle between them against the plagues, every year. Or else until Beldine, the name of an idol. It is then that a “dine” [the newly born?] of every livestock would be given over into the possession of Bel. Beldine accordingly bel-dine, a “dine” [the newly born?] of each livestock.”⁸⁴

However they were performed on mid-summer day, July 24th:

Ireland: “I find the following, much to our purpose, in the Gentleman's Magazine for February 1795, vol. lxxv. p. 124: “The Irish have ever been worshippers of Fire and of Baal, and are so to this day. This is owing to the Roman Catholics, who have artfully yielded to the superstitions of the natives, in order to gain and keep up an establishment, grafting Christianity upon Pagan rites. The chief festival in honour of the Sun and Fire is upon the 21st* of June, when the sun arrives at the summer solstice, or rather begins its retrograde motion. I was so fortunate in the summer of 1782, as to have my curiosity gratified by a sight of this ceremony to a very great extent of country. At the house where I was entertained, it was told me that we should see at midnight the most singular sight in Ireland, which was the lighting of Fires in honour of the Sun. Accordingly, exactly at midnight, the

⁸⁴ Whitley Stokes, Sanas Cormac: *Cormac's glossary, translated and annotated by late John O'Donovan LL.D.*, (Calcutta 1868), 19

Fires began to appear: and taking the advantage of going up to the leads of the house, which had a widely extended view, I saw on a radius of thirty miles, all around, the Fires burning on every eminence which the country afforded. I had a farther satisfaction in learning, from undoubted authority, that the people danced round the Fires, and at the close went through these fires, and made their sons and daughters, together with their cattle, pass through the Fire; and the whole was conducted with religious solemnity." This is at the end of some Reflections by the late Rev. Donald M'Queen, of Kilinuir in the Isle of Sky, on ancient Customs preserved in that Island."⁸⁵

Scotland: "the least considerable of them is that of midsummer. In the Highlands of Perthshire there are some vestiges of it. The cowherd goes three times round the fold, according to the course of the sun, with a burning torch in his hand. They imagined this rite had a tendency to purify their herds and flocks, and to prevent diseases. At their return the landlady makes an entertainment for the cowherd and his associates."⁸⁶

There are also references to 'Beltane Cow' within the early 14th century records of Earldom of Lancaster. However they associate the Beltane Cow with the feast of Michaelmas, September 29th:

"Rental of the Lands of Thomas, Earl of Lancaster, in Lonsdale and Amounderness, for the year ending at Michaelmas 1314.

Skerton. - ... of Beltancou this year which (que) only falls each third year, ...

Overton. - ... the custom called Beltankou at the term of Michaelmas"⁸⁷

And

"Lancaster and Amounderness. Memb 76, 1st Skin. C – Account of John de Lancastre, Keeper of the lands and tenements which were of Thomas, Late Earl of Lancastre from Michaelmas 17th year [1323] to the same feast following in the 18th year [1324].

Skerton - ... of a certsin custom called Beltincou he does not answer here because it was only paid every third year, ...

"Decay In Skerton (B). - ... of the custom called Beltencou for the cause aforesaid at t. Michaelmas, 16s."

Overton ... of a custom called Beltoncow he does not answer for the reason given in the manor of Skerton ..."⁸⁸

⁸⁵ Geeraert Brandtand Henry Ellis, "Observations on Popular Antiquities", Volume 1, 1813, 244

⁸⁶ John Ramsay, Alexander Allardyce, *Scotland and Scotsmen in the eighteenth century*, Volume 2, 1888, 436

⁸⁷ William Farr, *Lancashire Inquests, Extents, and Feudal Aids: 1205-1307*, The Royal Society, Volume 54, 1907, 23

⁸⁸ William Farr, *Lancashire Inquests, Extents, and Feudal Aids: 1205-1307*, The Royal Society, Volume 54, 1907, 174-5

Although *Beltaine* practices seem clearly at odds with Christain teaching and so likely to be pre-Christain in origin, there is no evidence to prove *Beltaine* is the actual name of a pre-Christain feast or when it should have occurred in the early Irish Christain period.

d. *Lughnasad*

The evidence in early Irish texts suggests that like *Samain*, *Lughnasad* has been moved from its original location. *Lughnasad* does not appear in the earliest list of cross quarter days given in *Tochmarc Emire*. Instead the start of harvest season (i.e., the autumn season) was called *Brón Trogain*:

Rawlinson B.512: “Co Brón Trogain .i. taiti fogmuir .i. is and dobronni trogan fua tort[h]ib. Trogan diu ainm do thalam.”⁸⁹

The later recension of *Tochmarc Emire* show has the addition of *Lughnasad* as an explanation to only one of the two references to *Brón Trogain*. Thus in applying that the text still considers *Brón Trogain* to be the primary name of the quarter:

Lebor na h-Uidre:⁹⁰

“Co prón trogein .i. lughnasad .i. taide fogamuir .i. is and dobroine trogain .i. talom fo toirtip. Trogan didiu ainm do talvm.”

“nad ecmongai benn Suain maic Roiscmilc o samshuan co h-oimhelc, h-o oimhelc co beldine, h-o beltine co brón trogain.”

While the ninth century glossaries are conflicted as to when *Lughnasad* was celebrated. *Lughnasad* is recorded at the start of *fogmar*. However *fogmar* though considered as autumn season is also considered by *Sanas Cormaic* to be the month before *mi gaim*, November, and hence the month of October.

Hence there are two possible readings as to then *Lughnasad* occurred: the beginning of autumn, i.e., august; or *Lughnasad* at the beginning of October:

Dúil Dromma Cetta entry for *Lughnasad*:⁹¹

D¹: “Lughnasa .i. nasad † acobair † gnas .i. nasad loga, ar is lug dorosgéld {?} aenach imbarach taite foghmair”

D²: “Lughnasa .i. nassadh logha, ar is lugh doroiscela aenach i marach taiti foghmuir”

⁸⁹ Kuno Meyer, *Tomarc Emire*, *Revue celtique*, Volume 11, 422

⁹⁰ Kuno Meyer, *Tochmarc Emire la Coinculaind*, *Zeitschrift für celtische Philologie*, Volume 3 London 1901, 246

⁹¹ Early Irish Glossaries Database (Online at <http://www.asnc.cam.ac.uk/irishglossaries/>) accessed 31 10 2015

D³: “[...] .i. nasad loga ar is lug [...]marach taite fogmair”

D⁴: “lugnasa .i. snasad † acobur no ginasa .i. nasad logha ar is lugh doroscel -aenach imarach taite fogmuir”

*Sanas Cormaic entry for Lugnasad:*⁹²

B: “Lúgnasad .i. cluiche † oenach is do is ainm násad .i. aurtach † cluiche Loga maic Ethne († Ethlend) nofertha lais um thaide fogamair.”

La: “Lugnasa .i. nasad Loga maic Ethlend .i. oenach nofertha laissom im thaitti fogomair”

M: “Lugasad .i. lognasad .i. nasad loga maic ceithlenn .i. enach lafertha laissom im thate fogmuir.”

Y: “Lugnasad .i. nasad Loga maic Ethlend .i. aonach † fertha lais im taite fogmair in gach bliadhain im thoidecht Lugnasad. Cluiche † aonach is do is ainm nasad.”

*Sanas Cormaic entry for Fogamur:*⁹³

B: “Fogamur .i. donmís derid is ainm isin fogamur .i. foġam .i. gæth 7 mur imbad ut est i mBrethu nemid imbera fogamur .i. foġemur id est fo gemur .i. dag gemur. Daġ .i. cruithnecht. inde dicitur triar dag .i. triar sacarbaic .i. sacer 7 pít .i. próind. ut dicitur Pít proind doromult inné, dearb is dámna aithrige, inglan mo chorp lir mogrus, glan intí rochoimprius. (MARG quasi fogamur .i. fota amir ngaim 7rl)”

M: “Fogomur dinmi dedenach is diless ansin fogamur .i. fota mis nġam 7rl.”

Y: “Fogamar .i. don mis dedenaig rohainmniged .i. quasi fogaimiur .i. fota mis ngaim.”

A 10th century poem, quoted below, implies that every fruit was ripe by the time of *Lugnasad*. Suggesting the month of October for *Lughnasad*, as at the beginning of August not all fruit would yet be ripe.

“Lugnassad luaid a hada cecha bliadna ceinmara fromad cech toraid co m-blaid biad lusraid la Lugnasaid.”

gloss: “lá aipchi na n-uili thorad immarach .i. la Lughnasad”⁹⁴

Translation:

⁹² Early Irish Glossaries Database (Online at <http://www.asnc.cam.ac.uk/irishglossaries/>) accessed 31 10 2015

⁹³ Early Irish Glossaries Database (Online at <http://www.asnc.cam.ac.uk/irishglossaries/>) accessed 31 10 2015

⁹⁴ Garrett S. Olmsted, *The gods of the Celts and the Indo-Europeans*, University of Innsbruck 1994, 110

“Lughnasad make known its customs in each wondrous year; tasting every renowned fruit, the food of plants on the day of Lughnasad.”

gloss: “tomorrow is the day all fruit has ripen, Lughnasad”⁹⁵

Lughansad is also associated with October by versions of *Lebor Gabala Erenn*, which place *Lughnasad* at end of October or the beginning of November.

For in the oldest surviving version of the *Lebor Gabala Erenn*, the *Miniugud version*, it says that *Oengus* (presumed to be the early 9th century author of *Felire Oengusso*⁹⁶) associated *Lughnasad* with the *Nasad Beóain Melláin* held yearly on October 26th:

“Ba congesib 7 airmbertaib nogníthi, .i. cóichigis ria Lughnasad 7 cóiechigis íarom; unde dicitur Lughnasad, i. aurdach nó sollomain Loga: unde Oengus post multum tempus dicebat: Nassad Logha no nasad Beóain Melláin.”⁹⁷

Translation:

“With gessa and feats of arms were they performed, a fortnight before Lughnasad and a fortnight after: unde dicitur Lughnasadh, that is, the celebration (?) or the festival of Lugh.” Hence Oengus with red ink after said the time was, “the nasad of Lug, or the nasad of Beoan [son] of Mellan.”⁹⁸

Felire Oengusso’s 9th century entry for October 26th is:

“Nasad beoa(i)n Mellan nach mod atanium, ...”⁹⁹

Translation:

“Nasad Beóan Mellán in every way I weave them together: ...”¹⁰⁰

The third rendition of *Lebor Gabala Erenn* tells that *Lughanasad* is month in which *Samain* was celebrated. And presumably *Samain* at the date of the composition, after the eight century, was November 1st:

⁹⁵ Olmsted, *The gods of the Celts and the Indo-Europeans*, 110

⁹⁶ R. A. Stewart MacAlister, *Lebor gabála Érenn: The book of the taking of Ireland, Part IV*, Volume 41, Dublin University Press 1941, 297

⁹⁷ MacAlister, *Lebor gabála Érenn: The book of the taking of Ireland, Part IV*, 116

⁹⁸ MacAlister, *Lebor gabála Érenn: The book of the taking of Ireland, Part IV*, 119

⁹⁹ Stokes, *Féilire Óengusso: The Martyrology of Oengus the Culdee*, 218

¹⁰⁰ Stokes, *Féilire Óengusso: The Martyrology of Oengus the Culdee*, 218

“... 7 conadh he a feart fuil o Fhoradh Tailltean soirthuaidh, condenta a cluichi gacha bliadna ag Ludh .i. caicis re Samain (sic) 7 caecis na diaidh go nadh desin ata Lughnasa beos, .i. nasad Logha meic Eithlind ainm in cluiche sin.”¹⁰¹

Translation:

“... and that is her grave which is north-east from the Seat of Tailltiu, so that her games were celebrated every year by Lug, a fortnight before Samain and a fortnight after, so that thence comes Lughnasad, i.e. the nasad of Lug s. Ethliu the name of that festivity.”¹⁰²

Lughnasad's association with *Samain* and the time of October can be shown in *Tochmarc Emire*:

“ATressc in Máirimtill isrubart, iss e Tailne in sin. Is and do geni Lug Scimmaig an fleid moir do Luog mauc Ethlend do dignad n-dou ier cath Moicchi Tuiriud. Ar ba si-sen a banaiss rigi. Ar ro rigsat Tuatai Dea iar marbad Nuadat inti Lug. Ait in ro cuiriud a treusc do rigne cnoc n-de. Ba h-e a ainm Tressc in Marimtill .i. Tailne andiu.”¹⁰³

Translation:

“The Remnants of the Great-ale-Feast I said, that is Tailne; It is there that Lug Scimaig gave the great feast to Lug, son of Ethle, to comfort him after the battle of Moytura, for that was his wedding feast of kingship [banaiss rigi]. For the Tuath Dea made this Lug king after Nuada been killed. As to the place in which their remnants were put, he made a large hill of them. The name was Knoll of the Great Feast, or Remnants of the Great-ale-Feast, i.e. Tailne to-day.”¹⁰⁴

Lug's victory was at the Second battle of *Magh Tuired* and is recorded in *Cath Maige Tuired*¹⁰⁵ and *Lebor Gabala Erenn*¹⁰⁶ as taking place at Samain. Hence Great Feast at *Tallne*, associated *Lughnasad*, took place following the Second battle of *Magh Tuired* at *Samain*. And hence concurs with the third rendition of *Lebor Gabala Erenn*, in which the games of *Tailtiu occur at Samain*, within the month of *Lughnasad*.

¹⁰¹ MacAlister, *Lebor gabála Érenn: The book of the taking of Ireland, Part IV*, 178

¹⁰² MacAlister, *Lebor gabála Érenn: The book of the taking of Ireland, Part IV*, 179

¹⁰³ Kuno Meyer, ‘Tochmarc Emire la Coinculaind’, *Zeitschrift für celtische Philologie* 3 (London – Paris 1901) (online at <http://www.ucc.ie/celt/published/G301021/>) accessed on 31 10 2015

¹⁰⁴ Kuno Meyer, ‘The Wooing of Emer’, *Archaeological Review*. volume 1, (London 1888) (online at <http://www.ucc.ie/celt/published/T301021/>) accessed on 31 10 2015

¹⁰⁵ *Cath Maige Tuired: The Second Battle of Mag Tuired* (online at <http://www.ucc.ie/celt/published/T300010.html>) accessed on 05 12 2015

¹⁰⁶ MacAlister, *Lebor gabála Érenn: The book of the taking of Ireland, Part IV*, 229

The Knoll of the Great Feast at *Tallne* which is referenced in *Tochmarc Emire* is probably the same knoll identified by Dr Binchy:

“Indeed we are told in Cormac’s Glossary (385) that one hillock at Oenach Tailten was called tulach na coibche. Now in the legal language coibche is most commonly used in the special sense of ‘bride-price’; but its primary meaning is ‘bargain, covenant’, and Cormac here glosses it by cendach, which suggests that he took it to include much more than marriage contracts. On the other hand the mass of popular traditions about ‘Teltown marriages’ collected by O’Donovan, Wilde, and Westropp may reflect ancient practice at Oenach Tailten, though some features of these ‘hand-fasting unions suggest a different background. Thus the date on which they were contracted was Beltaine (1 May), not Lughnasad (1 August), and this is also the day from which yearly marriages are reckoned in the Laws.”¹⁰⁷

Knoll of the Great Feast at *Tallne* is associated by *Tochmarc Emire* with Lugh’s marriage following his victory at *Samain*, with *Lughnasad* in *Cúán Úa Lothcháin’s Dindshenchas of Taltiu* (and later Teltown marriages) and by ancient marriage customs with *at Cet Samain*.

I should be noted that *Lughnasad* is only associated with October and *Samain* in material that post-dates the transference of All Martyrs’ Day to All Saints’ Day. Hence possible that *Lughnasad* was originally associated with *Samain* and start of summer.

At the start of the 11th century the *Dindshenchas of Taltiu* says that *Lughnasad* was held about the Kalends of August.

“Taltiu , Cúán Úa Lothcháin Cecinit

A chóemu críche Cuind chain éitsid bic ar bennachtain; co n-écius duíb senchas sen. suidigthe ónaig Thalten. Trí chét blíadan, fodagaib, teora blíadna do blíadnaib co gein Críst, coistid rissein, ón chét-óenuch i Taltein. Taltiu ingen Magmóir maill, ben Echach gairb maic Dúach daill, tánic sund ria slúag Fer mBolg co Cail Cúan iar cath chomard.

...

Fota a cuma, fota a cur i tám Thalten iar trom-thur; dollotar fir, diamboí i cacht, inse h-Érend fria h-edacht. Roráid-si riu 'na galur, ciarb énairt nírb amlabur, ara n-derntais, díchra in mod, cluiche caíntech dia caíniod. Im kalaind Auguist atbath, día lúain, Loga Lughnasad; imman lecht ón lúan ille prím-óenach h-Erend áine.”¹⁰⁸

Translation:

“O nobles of the land of comely Conn, hearken a while for a blessing, till I tell you the legend of the elders of the ordering of Taltiu’s Fair!

Three hundred years and three it covers, from the first Fair at Taltiu to the birth of Christ, hearken!

¹⁰⁷ Dr Daniel Binchy, ‘Fair of Taltiu and Feast of Tara’, *Eriu* 18 (1955), 124

¹⁰⁸ Edward Gwynn (ed), *The Metrical Dindshenchas, Volume 4*, Dublin Institute for Advanced Studies (Dublin 1991) (Online at <http://www.ucc.ie/celt/online/G106500D/>) accessed on 31 10 2015

Taltiu, daughter of gentle Magmor, wife of Eochu Garb son of Dui Dall, came hither leading the Fir Bolg host to Caill Chuan, after high battle.

...

Long was the sorrow, long the weariness of Taltiu, in sickness after heavy toil; the men of the island of Erin to whom she was in bondage came to receive her last behest.

She told them in her sickness (feeble she was but not speechless) that they should hold funeral games to lament her—zealous the deed.

About the Calends of August she died, on a Monday, on the Lughnasad of Lug; round her grave from that Monday forth is held the chief Fair of noble Erin."¹⁰⁹

Because of the association of the Dindshenchas of Taltiu with Cuan ua Lothchain, the Dindshenchas is dated to Maelsechlainn's celebration of Oenach Tailten in 1006.¹¹⁰ The first time Oenach Tailten had been held in seventy-nine years.

The later author of *Acallam na Senórach* continues the idea that *Trogain* had been replaced by the *Lughnasad*:

"mis trogain, risa raiter in lughnassadh" ¹¹¹

"mis trogain, risa ráidhter in lughnasadh"¹¹²

Translation:

"month of Trogain is now called Lughnasadh"

The chronology order of the Irish texts suggests that *Lughnasad* was not the original name of cross quarter day which started the harvest season. Instead the original name for that feast was *Brón Trogain*. *Lughnasad* was previously associated with *Samain* and the end of the harvest season, when all the fruit was ripe, i.e., October. By 1006 AD *Lughnasad* became associated with August, however the memory of the the original association of the time with *Brón Trogain* continued.

Council of Three Gauls

Lughnasad has been considered an ancient Celtic feast is due to Jubainville's belief that it existed in Roman Gaul:

¹⁰⁹ Edward Gwynn (ed), *The Metrical Dindshenchas, Volume 4*, Dublin Institute for Advanced Studies (Dublin 1991) (Online at <http://www.ucc.ie/celt/online/T106500D/>) accessed on 31 10 2015

¹¹⁰ The Metrical Dindshenchas (Online at <http://www.ucc.ie/celt/online/T106500D/>) accessed on 31 10 2015

¹¹¹ Whitley Stokes, Ernst Windisch (eds), 'Acallam Na Senórach', *Irische Texte* (Leipzig 1900), 10

¹¹² Whitley Stokes, Ernst Windisch (eds), 'Acallam Na Senórach', *Irische Texte* (Leipzig 1900), 129

“Cette fête chrétienne succédait à une fête païenne en l'honneur de Lug et des morts : de même à Tailtiu et à Cruachan qui étaient, comme Carmati, des cimetières païens.

Il paraît probable qu'avant le règne d'Auguste Lugu-dunum, notre Lyon, avait, comme chacun des cinq autres Lugu-dunum de Gaule, une foire analogue à ces trois foires irlandaises du 1st août. La grande fête religieuse célébrée tous les ans le 1st août en l'honneur d'Auguste pour toute la celtique romaine à Lyon y remplaça une fête moins importante qui, antérieurement, réunissait à la même date chaque année, en l'honneur du dieu celtique Lugus et des Gaulois défunts, les Segusiavi et peut-être quelques populations voisines ; les jeux miscelli, les tournois d'éloquence que Caligula y fit faire en sa présence, furent la continuation solennelle gallo-romaine d'usages celtiques moins pompeux, mais antérieurs de plusieurs siècles à cet empereur romain.”¹¹³

Translation:

“This Christian festival followed a pagan festival in honor of Lug and dead at the same Tailtiu and Cruachan which were, as Carmati, pagan cemeteries.

It seems likely that before the reign of Augustus Lugu-dunum our Lyon, had, like each of the other five Lugu-dunum of Gaul, a similar fair in these three Irish fairs of 1st August. The great religious holiday celebrated every year on 1st August in honor of Augustus for all the Roman Celtic in Lyon will replace a smaller party which previously met on the same date every year, in honor of the Celtic god Lugus and the deceased Gauls, the Segusiavi and maybe a few neighboring populations; miscelli the games, the eloquence tournaments Caligula made there do in his presence, were the Gallo-Roman Celtic solemn continuation uses less pompous, but previous centuries this Roman Emperor.”

This argument is circular: the feast at Lugdunum is considered Celtic because of its association with a date considered to be that of the Irish feast of Lughnasad; and Lughnasad is considered an ancient Celtic feast due to being associated with the date of a feast held at Lugdunum in Roman occupied Gaul.

Irish records do not originally associate Lughnasad with August, hence there is no association with feast at Lugdunum. There no justification for the ancient celebration of Lughnasad.

Nor is there evidence that feast at Lugdunum was ever Celtic in origin. The feast at Lugdunum was associated with the Roman Emperor Augustus from the earliest sources and is purely Roman in origin and tradition:

Periochae, Book 139, Livy (64/59 BC – 17 AD): “The Germanic tribes living on this side of the Rhine and across the Rhine were attacked by Drusus, and the uprising in Gaul, caused by the census, was suppressed.

¹¹³ H. d'Arbois de Jubainville, 'Introduction au Traité de la saisie privée dans le Senchus Mor', *Études sur le droit celtique*, 1895, 316-7

An altar was dedicated to the divine Caesar at the confluence of the Saône and Rhône, and a priest was appointed, Gaius Julius Vercondaridubnus."¹¹⁴

The Geography of Strabo (64/3 BC – 24 AD): "And it [Lugdunum] is the most populous of all the cities of Celtica except Narbo; for not only do people use it as an emporium, but the Roman governors coin their money there, both the silver and the gold. Again, the temple that was dedicated to Caesar Augustus by all the Galatae in common is situated in front of this city at the junction of the rivers. And in it is a noteworthy altar, bearing an inscription of the names of the tribes, sixty in number; and also images from these tribes, one from each tribe, and also another large altar [and also a great statue, i.e. of Augustus]."¹¹⁵

The Lives of the Twelve Caesars, The Life of Claudius, by C. Suetonius Tranquillus (c.69 AD to after 122 AD): "2 1 Claudius was born at Lugdunum on the Kalends of Augustus in the consulship of Iullus Antonius and Fabius Africanus, the very day when an altar was first dedicated to Augustus in that town, and he received the name of Tiberius Claudius Drusus. Later, on the adoption of his elder brother into the Julian family, he took the surname Germanicus."

Roman History by Cassius Dio (155-235 AD), Book 54: "32 1 Drusus had this same experience. The Sugambri and their allies had resorted to war, owing to the absence of Augustus and the fact that Gauls were restive under their slavery, and Drusus therefore seized the subject territory ahead of them, sending for the foremost men in it on the pretext of the festival which they celebrate even now around the altar of Augustus at Lugdunum."

The location of the festival occurred at Lugdunum, although a Gaulish cognate of the Irish god Lugh, it was a Roman City and Imperial Center of Gaul. The originator of the council was Drusus, the Roman governor of Gaul, and step-son (and rumored natural son) of Emperor Augustus. The altar raised at the council by Drusus, was to his "father" the Emperor of the Roman Empire.

The Calend of Sextilis was the favourite month favoured by Emperor Augustus:

"The name Augustus, in place of Sextilis, was introduced by the emperor himself, at the time when he rectified the error in the mode of intercalating (Suet. Aug. 100.31), anno Augustano xx. The first year of the Augustan era was 27 B.C., viz. that in which he first took the name of Augustus, se vii. et M. Vipsanio Agrippa coss. He was born in September; but gave the preference to the preceding month, for reasons stated in the senatus consultum, preserved by Macrobius (1.12): "Whereas the Emperor Augustus Caesar, in the month of Sextilis, was first admitted to the consulate, and thrice entered the city in triumph, and in the same month the legions, from the Janiculum, placed themselves under his auspices, and in the same month Egypt was brought under the authority of the Roman people, and in the same month an end was brought to the civil wars; and whereas for these reasons the said month is, and has been, most fortunate to this empire, it is hereby decreed by the senate that the

¹¹⁴ Livy: Periochae 134-142 (online at <http://www.livius.org/li-ln/livy/periochae/periochae134.html>) accessed on 31 10 2015

¹¹⁵ The Geography of Strabo, *Loeb Classical Library edition* Vol. II (1923) (online at http://penelope.uchicago.edu/Thayer/E/Roman/Texts/Strabo/4C*.html) accessed on 31 10 2015

said month shall be called Augustus." "A plebiscitum, to the same effect, was passed on the motion of Sextus Pacuvius, tribune of the plebs."¹¹⁶

And there is academic opinion that the council at Lugdunum, on Kalend of Augustus, was for the worship of Rome and Augustus and not Lugh:

"On 1 August 12 BC Drusus instituted the worship of Rome and Augustus (as reigning emperor) at the Altar built just outside Lugdunum, between the rivers (Saone) and Rhodanus (Rhône) and overlooking their confluence (whence, in fact, the Celtic name Condate) The ceremonial was under the direction of an Aeduan chief priest (sacerdos), and represented an open avowal of loyalty to the imperial power. Indeed, the choice of the date was not arbitrary, since it was the anniversary of Augustus' final victory over Antony and Cleopatra which had given him control of the whole Empire."¹¹⁷

And:

"This was suspected long ago by Hans Maver, who pointed out that there is no evidence for a pre-Roman Gaulish festival at Lugudunum, and that 1 August may have been selected simply because it was felt to be the most convenient day for a festival in honour of Augustus."¹¹⁸

There is no evidence for Lughnasad was originally celebrated at start of August. Nor evidence that Council of Three Gauls was originally Celtic in nature.

6. The Counter argument: History of All Saints Day

There has been an argument that All Saints' Day originates from pre-Christian feast of *Samain*. Hence it is necessary to review the history of All Saints Day.

Tradition of the celebration its precursor starts that All Martyrs' Day, held on May 13th, originates with transference Pantheon by Emperor Phocas (547-610) to Pope Boniface IV (550-615, pope until 608) and its rededication to St Mary and All Martyrs on May 13th in the year 607/8 AD. In the seventh century the Pantheon was known as 'Sancta Maria ad Martyres' and later called in the later eighth century 'Sancta Mariae Rotunda'.¹¹⁹ Even through early Roman and Irish lectionaries have not survived, Carolingian lectionaries

¹¹⁶ Sir William Smith, *Dictionary of Greek and Roman Antiquities*, C.C. Little and J. Brown 1853, 232

¹¹⁷ John Drinkwater, *Roman Gaul: The Three Provinces, 58 BC-AD 260* (Routledge 2014), 111-2

¹¹⁸ Bernhard Maier, 'Is Lugh to be identified with Mercury', *Eriu* 47 (1996), 130

¹¹⁹ Tod A. Marder, 'The Pantheon after Antiquity', *The Pantheon in Rome: Contributions to the Conference, Bern, November 9-12, 2006* (Bern 2009), 145.

show that 'Dedicatio sancta Maria ad martyres' was commemorated on May 13th in seventh century Roman liturgy.¹²⁰

All Martyrs Day reached the Irish Sea area by the early eight century for Bede's *Historia ecclesiastica Anglorum* (circa 731) mentions the dedication of the Pantheon:

"Hic est Bonifatius quartus a beato Gregorio Romanae urbis episcopo, qui inpetravit a Focate principe, donari Ecclesiae Christi templum Romae, quod Pantheon vocabatur ab antiquis, quasi simulacrum esset omnium deorum; in quo ipse, eliminata omni spurcitia, fecit ecclesiam sanctae Dei genetricis, atque omnium martyrum Christi, ut exclusa multitudine daemonum, multitudo ibi sanctorum memoriam haberet."¹²¹

Translation:

"Boniface was the fourth bishop of Rome after the blessed Gregory. He succeeded in his request to the Emperor Focas, that a Roman temple should be donated to the Church of Christ: it was called Pantheon from ancient times, as if it were a simulacrum of all the gods. Wherein he, after all the filth had been turned out of doors, made a church in honour of the holy Mother of God, and in honour of all the martyrs of Christ, so that, when the multitude of devils had been shut out, a multitude of saints could be remembered there."

Bede's *Historia ecclesiastica Anglorum* is repeated in the Irish Annals and in Northern Italy

Annals of Tigernach, T607.1:

"Phocas rogante papa Bonifacio iussit in ueteri fano quod Pantheum uocabatur, ablatis idolatrie sordibus, eclesiam beate semper uirginis Marie et omnium martirum fieri, ut ubi quondam omnium non deorum, sed demoniorum cultus agebatur, ibi deinceps omnium fieret memoria sanctorum."¹²²

Translation:

"Phocas at the request of pope Boniface commanded in the Old temple which was called the Pantheon, the removal of the filth of idolatry; the church of the blessed Mary and All Martyrs to be dictated, to which there has previously been no less of the gods, but the demons worshiped, henceforth there would be a memory of all the saints."¹²³

Annals of Ulster, U606.3:

¹²⁰ Mary Carruther, *Rhetoric Beyond Words: Delight and Persuasion in the Arts of the Middle Ages* (Cambridge University Press 2010), 289

¹²¹ A.M.Sellar, 'Delphi Complete Historical Works of the Venerable Bede', *Delphi Classics* (2015)

¹²² Whitley Stokes (ed), 'The annals of Tigernach', *Revue Celtique* 16-8 (1895-7) (online at <http://www.ucc.ie/celt/published/T100002A/>) accessed on 31 10 2015

¹²³ Gearóid Mac Niocaill, *The Annals of Tigernach* (unpublished) (Online at <http://www.ucc.ie/celt/T100002A/>) accessed on 31 10 2015

“Secundo anno Focce .i. imperatoris Gregorius Papa secundum Bedam migravit ad Dominum. Bonifatio rogante statuit sedem Romane & Apostolice Aeclesie caput esse omnium ecclesiarum, quia ecclesia Constantinopolitana primum se omnium ecclesiarum scribebat”¹²⁴

Translation:

“In the second year of the emperor Foccas, according to Bede, Pope Gregory went to the Lord. At the request of Boniface, he decreed the See of Rome and of the Apostolic Church to be head of all churches, because the Church of Constantinople was wont to describe itself as the premier church.”¹²⁵

Paulus Vinfridus (Paul the Deacon), Lombard (writing between 787-795/6):

“CAPUT XXXVII. De Foca Augusto, et eius nece, et imperio Eraclii.

Focas igitur, ut praemissum est, extincto Mauricio eiusque filiis, Romanorum regnum invadens, per octo annorum curricula principatus est. Hic rogante papa Bonifacio statuit sedem Romanae Ecclesiae ut caput esset omnium Ecclesiarum, quia Ecclesia Constantinopolitana primam se omnium Ecclesiarum scribebat. Idem alio papa Bonifacio petente iussit in veteri fano, quod Pantheon vocabatur, ablatis idololatriae sordibus, ecclesiam beatae semper virginis Mariae, et omnium sanctorum martyrum fieri, ut ubi quondam, non deorum, sed daemoniorum cultus habebatur, vel agebatur, ibi deinceps omnium fieret memoria sanctorum.”¹²⁶

Translation:

“Focas, therefore, as has been said, they have been annihilated, Mauritius and to his sons, he attacked the kingdom of the Romans, during the eight years that he passed the rule is. Here is the seat of the Roman Church, that the head of which was set up at the request of Pope Boniface for all the churches, because it is the first that all the Churches, the Church of Constantinople was writing. At the request of the temple in the Old Pope Boniface ordered the same with the other, which is called the Pantheon, if deprived of the filth of idolatry, church of the blessed Mary, ever a virgin, and of all the saints, of the martyrs to be made, so that where once were, not of gods, but of demons of worship, or was under discussion, there is the memory of the future should be made of all the saints.”

“CAPUT XI. De malis quae Constans Augustus Romanis intulit, et de praedationibus quas singulis regionibus fecit: et quomodo extinctus est.

.... Qui Augustus cum ad beati Petri limina pervenisset, obtulit ibi pallium auro textum, et manens apud Romam diebus duodecim, omnia quae fuerant antiquitus instructa ex aere in ornamentum civitatis deposuit, in tantum ut etiam basilicam beatae Mariae, quae aliquando

¹²⁴ Seán Mac Airt, Gearóid Mac Niocaill, *The Annals of Ulster to A.D. 1131* (Dublin 1983) (online at <http://www.ucc.ie/celt/G100001A/>) accessed 31 10 2015

¹²⁵ Seán Mac Airt, Gearóid Mac Niocaill, *The Annals of Ulster to A.D. 1131* (Dublin 1983) (online at <http://www.ucc.ie/celt/T100001A/>) accessed 31 10 2015

¹²⁶ Corpus Corporum (online at <http://www.mlaz.uzh.ch/MLS/>) accessed 31 10 2015

Pantheon vocabatur, et condita fuerat in honorem omnium deorum, et iam ibi per concessionem superiorum principum locus erat omnium martyrum, discooperiret, tegulasque aereas exinde auferret, easque simul cum aliis omnibus ornamentis Constantinopolim transmitteret.”¹²⁷

Translation:

“He August, they arrived at the threshold of the blessed Peter, offered there the pall woven of gold, and the days at Rome, being yet present, twelve; all that pertained to the ancient times of the city, furnished with down out of the air in the decoration, so much so that even the church of the Blessed Virgin Mary, which was called the Pantheon at any time things, and to had in honor of all the gods, by the granting of the higher of the princes of the place, and now there were all of the martyrs, to uncover her face, tegulasque of brass, from that time he would take away, and which at the same time, with the other transmitted to Constantinople, with all her ornaments.”

This origin story of All Martyrs also appears in Irish texts on the subject of Samain.

Don tSamain Beos from the Leabhar Breac:

"Feria omnium sanctorum. Is e fath ara n-abar feria omnium sanctorum frisin samain. Panteón .i. domus omnium hídgulorum (sic!) fuit in Romai. Co tarla Bonifatius comorba Petair in araile ló fair co n-epert frisin impeir co mba pudar tegdais do hidlaib do beith isin Roim iar forbairt na cristaideachta. Co ro coisecrad iarum la toil an impire (?) in Panteón ut do Muire 7 do uli noemu in domain connói n-graduib nime. Co n-aire sin atberair feria omnium sanctorum fria, ar ro coisecrad omnibus sanctis in tegdais boi oc na hídlaib remi.”¹²⁸

Translation:

“Feast of all saints. This is the principle according to which Samain is called Feast of all saints. Pantheon, that is, house of all the pagan gods was in Rome. Boniface, heir of Peter, came there one day and said to the Emperor that it was a shame for there to be a house of idols in Rome after the growth of Christianity. So the aforesaid Pantheon was then consecrated, with the permission of the Emperor, to Mary and to all the saints of the world and of the nine grades of heaven. To mark this, (the day) is called ‘the feast of all saints’, the feast on which the building which formerly (was dedicated) to idols was consecrated to all saints.” ¹²⁹

Scél Na Samna from the Leabhar Breac:

“... . As inann pantéon 7 dommus omnium deorum .i. tegduis na nuili dhée ár uile dhe in dom(ain) no hadhar(th)a lasna geinntibh ar sollum(un) na samhna gacha bliá(dna).

¹²⁷ Jacques-Paul Migne, ‘Landulfus Sagax’, *Patrologia Latina* (Paris 1851) (online at <http://www.mlat.uzh.ch/MLS/>) accessed 31 10 2015

¹²⁸

¹²⁹ Translation from OLD-IRISH-L Archives Fri, 20 Dec 2013 13:08:29 (online at <https://listserv.heanet.ie/>) accessed on 31 10 2015

Is e dano ba comarba petuir isin roim in tan sin boinefacius. Fear craibhd(e)c cunnail ecn(aid) ecl(as)da. Roiarside dano a iascaidh ar in righ in temp(all) úd dedhpuirt do phol 7 do phet(air) 7 a choisrecadh an ainm naemh in dom(ain) o turghabh(ail) co fuinedh. Dorad di in ri doside an ascaidh sin 7 rocoisercadh in temp(all) an ainm noebh in dom(ain) 7 robrisid na hidlu et doroine bonefacius aithfr(enn) do na naemuibh i llo na samhna. Conadh de sin do garar feria omnium s(an)ctorum don tsam(ain) .i. feria ("feil" written in margin here) nuili noebh ar adhr(a)d na nuili noem inti. Conidh he atb(er)aitseom gu nglantar tria aine na samhna gach aine loitter san bli(a)dn(a) tria ain{m}fis no tria eici(n)taidh."

Translation:

"... Pantheon is the same as "dommus omnium deorum", i.e. the residence of all the gods, because all the gods of the world used to be worshipped by the pagans on the feast of Samhain every year.

The successor then of Peter in Rome at that time was Boniface. A pious, constant, wise, religious man. He then asked the favor of the king to dedicate that temple to Paul and to Peter and to consecrate (it) in the name of the saints of the world from East to West.

Then the king did that favor for him, and consecrated the temple in the name of the saints of the world and the idols were smashed and Boniface said a Mass for the saints on the day of Samhain. And it is for that reason that Samhain is called Feast of All Saints, that is, Feast of All Saints because of adoration of all the saints on it. So that they say that every period of fasting which is violated in the year, through ignorance or necessity, is justified through the fast of Samhain."¹³⁰

Scél Na Samna based on the versions in the *Leabhar Mhic Cárthaigh Riabhaigh* and *Leabhar Fhear Maí*:

"... Báí tempall isin Róim in tan sin, Panteón a ainm, is inonn Panteón 7 domus omnium deorum .i. tegdais na nuile dée, óir uile dée an domain no adraittis las na genti ar sollmain na Samna cacha bliadna. Is é dan ba comarda Petair isin Róim an tan sin d'áirithe Bonifacius, fer cráibdech cunnail ecnaid eclasda. Ro iarside dan in ascaid ar in rí in tempall út d'idbuidt do Pétar 7 do Pól, 7 a coisrecad i nainm naem in domain ó turgabáil co fuined. Do rat dan in rí doside in ascaid sin 7 ro coisrecad in tempull i nainm naem in domain 7 ro brised na híduil, 7 dorigne Aifrenn do naemuib in domain hi lló na Samna. Conid desin gairear feria omnium sanctorum don tSamain .i. feil na nuili naem innti. Conid é atbertsom co nglantar tria áine na Samna cach áine loittear isin bliadain tria ainbfis nó tria écentaid."¹³¹

Fagail na samna makes the same connection between *Samain* and Pope Boniface and Pantheon. It remains untranscribed and untranslated.

¹³⁰ Translation from OLD-IRISH-L Archives Sat, 7 Jun 2014 22:50:18 (online at <https://listserv.heanet.ie/>) accessed on 31 10 2015

¹³¹ Mil na mbeach, Columban League, Dublin 1911, 57-61 & 98-100

Sicard of Cremona (d. 1215) recorded that Pope Gregory VII (1073-85) finally suppressed May 13th and mandated November 1st as the date to celebrate the Feast of All Saints.

Although All Martyrs continues to be mention:

The 12th century *Félire hUa Gormáin* entry for May 13th:

“Tempal ergna erdeirc, roboi do déibh domhoin ir-Róim ridge rebaig Bonefait ros-bendaig do Maire buain bladaig, col-lín sluaigh a senaid.”¹³²

Tranlsation:

“A temple, noted, renowned, which had belonged to the gods of the (heathen) world, in royal, featful Rome, Bonifacius, with the full number of the host of his synod, consecrated it to Mary the lasting, famous.”¹³³

The 12th century *Drummond Kalendar* records on May 13th: ‘Sanctae Mariae ad martyres’¹³⁴

The transference to All Martyrs from May 13th to November 1st and renamed All Saints

The transference of All Martyrs in Rome to November 1st is credited to Gregory III who is recorded as dedicating a chapel in St. Peter’s in Rome to honour of all saints, on November 1st, 731.

According to *Martology of Ado*, circa 855 AD, the Church moved the celebration All Martyrs on May 13th to celebrating All Saints on November 1st. Hence Emperor Louis the Pious (778-840), the son and heir of Charlemagne, at the instruction of Pope Gregory IV held feast of All Saints yearly on November 1st across his kingdom of France. This has dated to 831 AD Louis the Pious regains power following a civil war in his kingdom.

This tranfserance of name may reflect the growing importance of the cult of saints over the cult of martyrs. For example the Irish and Anglo-Saxon churches could not draw on their own tradition of Martyrs for their conversion was principally bloodless:

Hennig writing on Ireland’s situation:

“The most outstanding characteristics of the peculiar development of the Irish Church from this primitive stage of liturgical matters to conformity with the other parts of the Church are due to the absence of native martyrs. The Antiphony of Bangor is expressive of the first

¹³² Stokes, *The Martyology of Gorman: Féilire hUa Gormáin*, 96

¹³³ Stokes, *The Martyology of Gorman: Féilire hUa Gormáin*, 97

¹³⁴ George H. Forbes, *Missale Drummondense* (Burntisland 1882), 14

attempt to bridge the gap existing between the historical devotion to Saints abroad, based on the cultus martyrum, and the more diffuse devotion to native Saints.”¹³⁵

And the Anglo-Saxons:

“In some places, violence perpetrated by Christians and pagans accompanied the transition to the new religion, but the Anglo-Saxon England, there were no martyrs on either side.”¹³⁶

Texts reflecting All Saints as the the transference of All Martyrs

The variants of Martyrologium Hieronymianum reflect the change in date and name of All Martyrs formerly celebrated on May 13th:

Codex Wissenburgensis from Wolfenbützel, Germany, circa 756-772, has All Martyrs recorded on both May 13th and November 1st:

May 13th:

“scae mariae ad martyr”¹³⁷

November 1st:

“LETANIAS INDIC. MEN. NOU. HA BET DIES XXX
KL. NOUEMB. Petavis cuiũ de dicatio festiuitatis s̄ci hela ri ēpi et conf̄ petri mammeri
saturnini
In machedonia
dedi catio basilicae iacobi et iohannis apostoli
In tarracina
nā s̄co rum meldagasi iuliani uicto ris . felicis crisentis item felicis satti octauiae cessiae
maxi mę ristae saturninae donate simplicię primae cesari
et in cae saria cappado
cię Nā s̄ci macedo ni et alibi s̄corum ianuari uita lis petri crisentis Uictorini mā
et lingonice
cuiũ castro dioni be nigni pr̄bi mā et s̄cae mariae mā et s̄ci melanti
Agusteduno gā dē s̄ci
primi ēpi In sidio monasterio dē s̄ci audomari conf̄”¹³⁸

Codex Bernensis 289, dated to the end of 8th century, makes no refence to All Martyrs on May 13th and instead records *S̄cae Marie et marte* on November 1st:

¹³⁵ John Henning, Michael Richter, *Medieval Ireland, Saints and Martyrologies*, (Variorum Reprints 1989), ii

¹³⁶ Joseph H. Lynch, *Christianizing Kinship: Ritual Sponsorship in Anglo-Saxon England* (Cornell University Press 1998), 51.

¹³⁷ Johannes Bolland, *Acta sanctorum, Parts 3-4* (Brussels 1894), 60

¹³⁸ Johannes Bolland, *Acta sanctorum, Parts 3-4* (Brussels 1894), 138

May 13th:

No mention of All Martyrs on May 13th

November 1st

“LAETANIAS. INDICENDAS MENS. NOUB. HABET DIES XXX

KL. NOUEB. PICTAUIS Ciuif Dedicaf basilicę Sçi Hilari [prius Helari] epi et conf Petri.

Mammeri. Saturnini.

In Machedon.

Dedicař basilicę. Iacobi. et Iohannis . apostolorū

In Tarracina.

Natale Sçorū. Melta gasi . Iuliani . Uictoris . Felicis . Criscentis. It. Felicis . Satti . Perşę ueranti . Octauie Cessię . Maximi . Risthe. Saturnini . Donatę.Simplicię . Primę Cesari.

Et In Cappado

cie . Natř Sçi . Machedoni. et alibi . Sçorū . Ianuarii. Uitalis . Petri . Criscentis. Uictorini
martyris.

In Gall. Roten.

Depoš . Sçi Amanti epi.

In Gall. Territvrio.

beturico Noncupante. Dolos uico . depoř Sçi Lusoris . pueri et conf

Et Lingonice.

ciuiř castro diuiono [emend. diuioni] . Benigni presbiř et mař et alibi. *Sçae Marie et marte.*

In Beturio

Gor tonis . castro . Depoš Rumoli presbiteri. et Sçi Melanti.

In Gall. Agustiduno.

Primini epi. Et festiuitas omnium scorum”¹³⁹

Codex Epternacensis, 9th century, has *sçae mariae* where *Codex Bernensis 289* has *Sçae Marie et marte*:

May 13th:

No mention of All Martyrs on May 13th

November 1st:

“Noimber dies XXX.

Kl noemþ in assia nř macedonis iuliani victoris felicis et in melitia cristatis petri mammeri |
saturnini

In macidõ

vigilanti nundini interrař meldacasi | Iuliani victoris felicis crescentis Iř felicis satti
perseveranti | octaviae cassiae maximae faustae saturninae donatae | simpliciae primae In
cessâ

capþ

macedoni et alibi ianuari vitalis | petri crescentis victorini marcoti

rotenus gař

¹³⁹ Johannes Bolland, *Acta sanctorum, Parts 3-4* (Brussels 1894), 138

s̄ci amantini ēpi | betoricas lusoris confēs gāł civī
lengonī
benigni pr̄b et mār et | alibi s̄cae mariae et s̄ci melanti agustuduñ pimini ēpi.”¹⁴⁰

However variants of Codex Epternacensis show its original association: *Martyrology of the Abbey of Rheim*, manuscript Paris. lat. 17189, uses the term *maria mart.*¹⁴¹ And *Sacramentarium Gellonense*, circa 790, made for the bishop of Cambrai, uses *Mariae mar.*¹⁴²

In other variants of Martyrologium Hieronymianum there is no reference to All Martyrs, instead the day is referenced as *Festivitas omnium sanctorum*, “All Saints’ Day”.

*Annales Weissenburgenses*¹⁴³ (750-800) and repeated in the later *St. Gallen* martyrology¹⁴⁴ (800 - 850):

May 13th:

No mention of All Martyrs on May 13th

November 1st:

“1 Kal. Novemb. Litanía indicenda. *Festivitas omnium sanctorum*. Petri, Mammerti, Saturnini, Magni. Et passio Eustachii martyris cum uxore et filiis.
In Macedonia,
Basilis, Iacobi, et sancti Ioannis evangelistae.
In Terracina,
natis sanctorum Meldegasi, Iuliani, Victoris, Felicis, Sati, Perseveranti, Octaviae, Cessiae, Eristei, Saturnini, Simplicii, Primi, Cesarii, Magni, Iusti.
In Caesaria,
natis sancti Macedonii. Et alibi, natis sanctorum Ianuarii, Petri, Crescentis, Victurini, et aliorum martyrum. Castro Divione, passio sancti Benigni presbyteri et martyris, et sancti Melanti. Augustiduno,
depositio sancti Primi episcopi.
Baiocas civitate, sancti Vigorio episcopi et confessoris.
Sitio monasterio, depositio sancti Audomari episcopi et confessoris.
Pictavis civitate, dedicatio basilicae S. Hilarii episcopi et confessoris.”

Related to the *Annales Weissenburgenses* (and later *St Gallen* manuscript) is the later Irish *Feilre Oengusso* (circa 830), which shares the same reference to Hilarius of Poitiers on November 1st:

¹⁴⁰ Johannes Bolland, *Acta sanctorum, Parts 3-4* (Brussels 1894), 138

¹⁴¹ Johannes Bolland, *Acta sanctorum, Parts 3-4* (Brussels 1894), 138

¹⁴² Johannes Bolland, *Acta sanctorum, Parts 3-4* (Brussels 1894), 138

¹⁴³ Cod. Guelf. 81 Weiss, (online at <http://www.monumenta.ch/latein/>) accessed on 12 06 2015

¹⁴⁴ St. Gallen, Stiftsbibliothek / Cod. Sang. (online at <http://www.monumenta.ch/latein/>) accessed on 12 06 2015

May 13th:

No mention of All Martyrs on May 13th

November 1st:

“Mí Nouimbir

Lonán, Colmán, Cronán, cona cléir gil gránaig: slúaig Helair deirb dálaig sóerait samain sánaig,”¹⁴⁵

Translation:

“November

Lonán, Colmán, Cronán with their bright sunny following: the hosts of Hilarius sure multitudinous ennoble stormy All-Saints’ day.”¹⁴⁶

The use of Samain for All Saints day is also found in the later *Félire hUa Gormáin*, 12th century:

May 13th:

No mention of All Martyrs on May 13th

November 1st:

“Nouember 1. d

For sruithlo na samna in Commde fein fegaid, na hangeil drong diamair, ule noeim ind nime, sloigh co nglaine glegil, ma Maire moir miadaig, ... For in lith-sin Lonán, Cronán, Colmán coemseng,...”¹⁴⁷

Translation:

“November 1. D.

On the venerable day of Allhallowtide behold ye Lord Himself, the angels, a mystical band, and all the saints in heaven, hosts with clear white purity, around great honourable Mary, ... On that festival Lonán, Cronán, dear sleander Colmán, ...”¹⁴⁸

Unfortunately surviving manuscripts of the *Martyrology of Tallaght*, also by *Oengusso the Culdee*, are unfortunately missing the month of November. What can be noted is that there is no mention of All Martyrs Day on May 13th.

¹⁴⁵ Stokes, *Félire Óengusso: The Martyrology of Oengus the Culdee*, 232

¹⁴⁶ Stokes, *Félire Óengusso: The Martyrology of Oengus the Culdee*, 232

¹⁴⁷ Stokes, *The Martyrology of Gorman: Féilire hUa Gormáin*, 208

¹⁴⁸ Stokes, *The Martyrology of Gorman: Féilire hUa Gormáin*, 209

The following texts records All Saints on November 1st with regard to the tradition of All Martyrs Day

Florus of Lyon, circa 830:

May 13th:

No mention of All Martyrs on May 13th

November 1st:

“KL. NOV. Natale sancti Caesarii, et festivitas omnium sanctorum. Hacc festivitas sanctorum generalis est Romae; petente namque papa Bonifatio, iussit "Focas" imperator, in veteri fano quod Panthéon vocabatur, ablatis idololatriae sordibus. ecclesiam sanctae Mariae semper virginis et omnium martyrum lieri, ut ubi quondam omnium non deoruin, sed daemoniorum cultus agebatur, ibi deinceps omnium fieret memoria sanctorum.”¹⁴⁹

Translation:

“Feast day of St. Caesarius, and the feast of All Saints. Of Koz another piece feast of the saints of the general is in Rome; For the request of Pope Boniface, he ordered the "watch-fires," The General, in the Old Pantheon used to be called the temple of that, if deprived of the filth of idolatry. tinue his, ever a virgin, and of all of the martyrs of the church of St. Mary, in order that there has previously been no less sprung from gods, but of demons worship was led by, there should be made one after another of all the memory of the saints.”

Martology of Hrabanus Maurus, circa 845, contains boths All Martyrs and All Saints:

On May 14th instead of May 13th:

“Ipso die Mariae martyris festivitas celebratur: ...”¹⁵⁰

Tranlsation:

“Feast day of Mary Martyrs celebrated: ...”

November 1st:

“Ipsa die memoria celebratur omnium sanctorum, quod constituit Bonifacius papa, qui delubrum vetustum, quod ab antiquis Pantheon vocabatur, concedente Focato Cesare, in honorem sanctae Mariae Virginis et omnium sanctorum dedicavit. Item in eodem die in monasterio Fulda dedicatio ecclesiae sancti Bonifacii, et translatio corporis eiusdem sancti martyris.”¹⁵¹

Tranlsation:

¹⁴⁹ Paul d' Estrée, *Les martyrologes historiques du moyen age* (Paris 1907), 637

¹⁵⁰ Hrabanus Maurus (online at <http://www.monumenta.ch/latein/>) accessed on 31 10 2015

¹⁵¹ Hrabanus Maurus (online at <http://www.monumenta.ch/latein/>) accessed on 31 10 2015

"On the same day is celebrated in memory of all the saints, that Pope Boniface constituted, an old temple, which was called by the ancients Pantheon, with the concession of the Emperor Phocas, dedicated to the honor of the Holy Virgin Mary and all the saints. Again, in the dedication of the church of St. Boniface, on the same day in the monastery of Fulda, and the translation of a body of the holy martyr."

Martology of Ado, circa 855:

May 13th:

"ad III. Idus Mai.; Natalis S. Mariae ad Martyres. Phoca Imperatore b. Bonifacius Papa in veten fano, quod Pantheon vocabatur, — ecclesiam beatae semper virginis Mariae et omnium Martyrum dedicavit. Cujus dedicationis sacratissima dies agitur Romae III. Idus Maii."

Translation:

"May 13th: of the Nativity of St. Mary to the Martyrs. Emperor Phocas B. Pope Boniface in the old temple, which is called the Pantheon, dedicated the church of the blessed Mary, ever Virgin, and of all martyrs. His dedication is the most sacred days of Rome May 13th."¹⁵²

November 1st:

Id. ad Kal. Nov. Festivitas SS. omnium. Petente namque P. Bonifacio jussit Phocas Imp. in veteri fano, quod Pantheon vocabatur— ecclesiam b. semperque Virg. Mariae et omnium Martyrum fieri, ut ubi quondam omnium non Deorum sed daemoniorum cultus agebatur, ibi deinceps omnium fieret memoria Sanctorum: quae ab illo tempore Kal. Nov. in urbe Roma celebris et generalis agitur. Sed et in Galliis, monente S. recordationis Gregorio Pontifice, piissimus Ludovicus Imp., omnibus regni et imperil sui Episcopis consentientibus, statuit ut solemniter festivitas OO. SS. in praedicta die annuatim perpetuo ageretur."¹⁵³

Translation:

"Feast of All Saints. At the request of the Pope Bonifacio, Emperor Phocae ordered the old temple, which is called the Pantheon, Boniface dedicate it to the Virgin. Mary and All Martyrs, where not gods but demons were formerly worshipped, after all there was the memory of saints: by that time, November 1st in the city of Rome and by the general is the subject. Moreover, in France, by the instruction and memory of Pope Gregory, Emperor Louis the Pious, with the consent of all the bishops of the kingdom, and of his empire, he set that has been taken solemnly the feast of All Saints in the aforesaid on a yearly continious."

Ado's Martyrologium Romanum:

May 13th:

¹⁵² Johann K. L. Gieseler, Francis Cunningham, *Text-book of Ecclesiastical History, Volume 2* (Philadelphia 1836), 60

¹⁵³ Johann K. L. Gieseler, Francis Cunningham, *Text-book of Ecclesiastical History, Volume 2* (Philadelphia 1836), 60

“VII P III Id. Servatii Episcopi. S. Mariae ad martyres dedicationis dies agitur, à Bonifacio Papa sta tutus.”¹⁵⁴

November 1st:

“Kal. Nov. Festivitas Sanctorum, quae celebris et generalis agitur Romae. Caesarii diaconi et martyris, et Iuliani presbyteri. Et Severini monachi, de Tiburtina civitate.”¹⁵⁵

And within Ireland and England

The *Old English Martyrology*, late eighth or early ninth centuries of Mercian origin, acknowledges the All Martyrs tradition of All Saints:

November 1st:

“On the first day of the month is the festival of All Saints. This festival was first instituted by pope Bonifacius in Rome, when he consecrated as a church for St. Mary and all the martyrs of Christ the temple of idols that is called Pantheon. There the Romans sacrificed to all their idols as long as they were pagans, and since they were Christians, they worshipped there the memory of all saints. The pope commanded that this day should be observed every year among Christian nations with the same reverence as the first day of Christmas, that is the first day of Yule.”

The early 10th century *Exeter Guild Statutes* refer to an assembly at All Hallows, i.e. eallhælegna, not at the start of summer, however as following Easter, i.e., All Martyrs Day, May 13th:

“+ þeos geamnung is gesamnod on Exanceastre for Godes lufun 7 for use saule þeafe, æþer ‘ge’ uses lifes gesundfulnesse gee ac be þæm æfteran dægum þe we to Godes dome for us sylfe ebon willaþ. Þonne habbaþ we gecweden þæt ure mytting sie þriwa on .xii. monðum: ane to Sancte Michael’s mæssan; oþre siðe to Sancte Marian mæssan ofer midne winter; þriddan siþe on eallhælegna mæssedæg ofer Eastron. ...”¹⁵⁶

Translation:

“The council convened at Exeter for the love of God and for our souls’ need, both for our welfare in life and in the afterlife too, which we hope may be granted us as God’s judgement on our lives. To that end, we have agreed that we shall have three meetings in twelve months: one at St Michael’s Mass; a second time at St Mary’s Mass after midwinter; a third time at All Saints’ Massday after Easter. ...”¹⁵⁷

¹⁵⁴ Ado Viennensis (online at <http://www.monumenta.ch/>) accessed on 31 10 2015

¹⁵⁵ Ado Viennensis (online at <http://www.monumenta.ch/>) accessed on 31 10 2015

¹⁵⁶ Patrick W. Conner, *Anglo-Saxon Exeter: A Tenth-century Cultural History*, (Boydell & Brewer Ltd 1993), 168-9.

¹⁵⁷ Dorothy Whitelock, *English Historical Documents, 500-1042*, 1996, 605.

Félire hUa Gormáin, twelveth century:

May 13th:

“Tempal ergna erdeirc, roboi do déibh domhoin ir-Róim rida rebaig Bonefait ros-bendaig, col-lín sluaigh a senaid. Mael doid nár domma, feil mo Chonna credail, tám Tigernaigh Boirchich ind fir toirt[h]ig trebair.”¹⁵⁸

Translation:

“A temple, noted, renowned, which had belonged to the gods of the (heathen) world, in royal, featful Rome, Bonifacius, with the full number of the host of his synod, consecrated it to Mary the lasting, famous.”¹⁵⁹

November 1st:

“For sruithlo na sama in Commde fein fegaid, na hangeil drong diamar, ule noeim ind nime, sloigh co nglaine glegil, ma Maire moir miadaig,”¹⁶⁰

Translation:

“On the venerable day of Allhallowtide behold ye Lord Himself, the angels, a mystical band, and all the saints of heaven, hosts with clear whie purity, around great honourable Mary.”¹⁶¹

Martyrology of Holy Trinity at Christ Church, mid-thirteenth century:

May 13th:

“Natalis sancte Marie ad martires. Foca namque imperante, beatus Bonifatius papa, in ueteri fane quod Panteon uocabatur, ablatis ydolatrie sordibus, ecclesiam beate semper uirginis Marie et omnium martirum dedicauit. Cuius dedicationis sacratissima dies agitui-.iii. idus Maii.”¹⁶²

Translation:

“Natalis sancte Marie ad martires. Watch-fires of authority, the blessed pope Boniface, the Old temple which was called the Pantheon, removal of the filth of idolatry; the church of blessed Marie et omnium martirum dedication. The dedication of the most sacred days of the act - . iii. Ides of May (i.e., May 13th).”

¹⁵⁸ Stokes, *The Martyrology of Gorman: Félire hUa Gormáin*, 96

¹⁵⁹ Stokes, *The Martyrology of Gorman: Félire hUa Gormáin*, 96

¹⁶⁰ Stokes, *The Martyrology of Gorman: Félire hUa Gormáin*, 208

¹⁶¹ Stokes, *The Martyrology of Gorman: Félire hUa Gormáin*, 208

¹⁶² John C. Crosiwaite, *The book of obits and martyrology of the Cathedral church of the Holy Trinity, commonly called Christ church* (Dublin 1844), 115

November 1st:

“...festiuitas omnium sanctorum. Hec festiuitas sanctorum generalis est Rome. Petente namque papa Bonifatio, iussit Bonifatio imperator in ueteri fano, quod Panteon uocabatur, ablatis ydolatrie sordibus, ecclesiam sancte Marie et omnium fieri martjrum, ut ubi quondam non deorum sed demoniorum cultus agebatur, ibi deinceps fieret memoria omnium sanctorum. ...”¹⁶³

Translation:

“... the feast of All Saints. This is a feast of the saints of the general is at Rome. Pope Boniface for the request, the emperor ordered Boniface in the old temple, which was called the Pantheon, removal of the filth of idolatry; Church of St. Mary and All Martyrs, where once worshiped as gods, but of demons, henceforth there would be a memory of all the saints.”

Texts reflecting only All Saints Day

The *Metrical Calendar of York*, (754-766), personal devotion written in hexameter, may be one of the earliest references of the feast of ‘omnium sanctorum’ when it references ‘fulget sanctorum’:

Month of May:

No mention of All Martyrs’s day

Month of November:

“Multiplici rutilet gemma seu in fronte November / Cunctorum fulget sanctorum laude decorus.”¹⁶⁴

Translation:

“Multi-faceted gem shines at the beginning November / it gleams with the praise of all the Saints.”

The use of the term “fronte November” also appears in *Martology of Wandelbert* of Abbey of Prüm, circa 847:

May 13th:

No mention of All Martyrs on May 13th

November 1st:

¹⁶³ Crosiwaite, *The book of obits and martyrology of the Cathedral church of the Holy Trinity, commonly called Christ church*, 172

¹⁶⁴ John A. Giles, *The Complete Works of Venerable Bede* (London 1843), 53

“Dies 1 - Kal Nov

Caesarius prima designat fronte Novembrem, eximio cuius laetatur Roma triumpho. Mensis et hic reliquos stellato vertice vincens, uno omnes sanctos celebrans coniungit honore, regia quos coeli pariter retinetque fovetque. Quartis, Victorine, sacer martyrique bearis.”¹⁶⁵

Translation:

“Day 1 – November 1st

Caesaris first designate of the beginning of November, most notable of which rejoices in the triumph of Rome. This month, defeating the rest of the top stars, one celebrant joins honor all the saints, whom the king of heaven as well retains and nurtures. Fourth, Victorine, the sacred martyrique secluded.”

It is probable that the “Multi-faceted gem” of the *Metrical Calendar of York*, like *Martology of Wandelbert* is referencing a star or group of stars. The *Old English Martyrology*, late eighth or early ninth centuries of Mercian origin, hints what the stars are being referenced. For on November 7th, the beginning of winter, is described thus:

“On the seventh day of the month is winter’s commencement. Winter has ninety-two days: then the seven stars rise in the evening and set at daybreak.”¹⁶⁶

The seven stars undoubtedly are pleisade. The rising and setting of the pleisade mark the beginning of the classical world’s summer and winter.

Bede writes: “But Greeks and Romans, whose authority on these matters, rather than that of Spaniards, it is generally preferable to follow, deem that winter begins on the 7th ides of November [7 November], spring on the 7th ides of February [7 February], summer on the 7th ides of May [9 May], and autumn on the 7th ides of August [7 August]. Noting that summer and winter begin with the evening or morning of the rising and setting of the Pleiades, they place the commencement of spring and autumn when the Pleiades rise and set around the middle of the night. Then again in the finest and most authoritative books of the cosmographers, we find the same seasons clearly distinguished, with the rising of the Pleiades observed at the 7th ides of May [9 May] and their setting at the 7th ides of November [7 November]. And Pliny the Elder in the second book of his *Natural History* judges that they are to be divided in the same manner.”¹⁶⁷

For some Christians winter began on November 1st. The Rules of St. Benedict of Nursia (c.530), pre-dating the use in Irish records, says:

“CHAPTER 8 Of the Divine Office during the Night

Making due allowance for circumstances, the brethren will rise during the winter season, that is, from the calends of November till Easter, at the eighth hour of the night; so that,

¹⁶⁵ Wandalbertus Prumiensis (online at <http://www.mlat.uzh.ch/MLS/>) accessed 31 10 2015

¹⁶⁶ Georg Herzfeld, *An Old English martyrology*, Early English Text Society, Issue 116 (London 1900), 203

¹⁶⁷ Wallis, *Bede, The Reckoning of Time*, 101-2

having rested till a little after midnight, they may rise refreshed. The time, however, which remains over after the night office (Matins) will be employed in study by those of the brethren who still have some parts of the psalms and the lessons to learn.

But from Easter to the aforesaid calends, let the hour for celebrating the night office (Matins) be so arranged, that after a very short interval, during which the brethren may go out for the necessities of nature, the morning office (Lauds), which is to be said at the break of day, may follow presently.”¹⁶⁸

So it is possible that the stars mentioned on November 1st in *Metrical Calendar of York and Martology of Wandelbert* are the seven stars of the *Old English Martyrology* marking the start of winter. Or alternatively they rising of Pleiades and the start of summer that Ovid *Fasti* associated with May 13th, i.e., the celebration that was moved to November 1st.

A letter from Cathwulf (a priest most likely at St Denis, Paris) in 775 to his king Charlemagne, requests Charlemagne to institute a feast to Holy Trinity and of the unity of all the saints and angels:

“Item : Confiteantur tibi, Domine, omnes reges terræ, et cantent in canticis Domino, et reliqua. Ergo, mi rex, si vobis placeat hoc consilium, pro his omnibus pro te et pro exercitu christianorum: ut unum diem post ieiunium in anno in honore sanctæ Trinitatis et unitatis et angelorum et omnium sanctorum celebrem constitues super regnum tuum cum consilio synodi Francorum; et missam sancti Michaelis et sancti Petri passionem in publico celebrare regno tuo constitues. Haec et his similia tibi faciente, tunc certe cum magna felicitate et beatitudine tu et membra Christi tecum hic et in futuro regnabitis cum angelis et archangelis sine fine et cum omnibus sanctis manebitis in gaudio in secula seculorum amen.”¹⁶⁹

Translation:

“Item: give glory to thee, O Lord, All the kings of the earth, and sing the Lord's song, and so on. Therefore, my king, if you have to do this counsel had, any of these things for thee, and for the army of Christians: that we worship one day after the fast, in the year, in the feast, in honor of the Holy Trinity and of the unity of all the saints and angels, and shall appoint, with the advice of the synod of the French over the kingdom from thee; the passion of St. Michael and of St. Peter to celebrate the Mass and your kingdom shall you make you in public. These and such like: of the efficiency of you, then we are here with you, with a great success and happiness, and in the future, you and the members of Christ, will reign with the angels and archangels, and with all the saints, ye shall abide in the joy without end, for ever and ever, Amen. ”

It may be questionable that he actually besoughting from Charlemagne for feast for All Saints. All Saints in church tradition is a fast day. The evoking ‘all saints’ in the company of the holy trinity and angelic, seems be formalic as in Alcuin’s letter to the abbey of Fulda, 801/2 AD:

¹⁶⁸ Verheyen, *The Holy Rule of St. Benedict*

¹⁶⁹ Philippus Jaffe, *Epistolae Carolina*, Bibliotheca Rerum Germanicarum, Volume 4 (Berlin 1867), 340

“Misi cartulam vobis...ut habeatis singulis diebus quibus preces Deo dirigere cuilibet placeat: quando in honorem sanctae Trinitatis, quando de amore sapientiae, quando de penitentiae lacrimis, quando de caritate perfecta, vel quando de suffragio angelico postulando vel omnium sanctorum cuilibet postulare placet; vel etiam si quis pro peccatis suis, vel pro quolibet amico vivente, vel etiam pro amicis plurimis, vel etiam fratribus de hoc saeculo recedentibus facere velit orationes; vel quando specialiter beatae Mariae genetricis Dei Virginis perpetuae deprecari velit intercessionem; vel etiam sanctissimi patris vestri Bonifacii cantare quis velit, et praesentiam illius piissimam advocare precibus.”¹⁷⁰

Translation:

“Now I have sent the charter to each of you, please ... you may have each day on which to direct our prayers to God: when he is in honor of the Holy Trinity, when I speak of the love of wisdom, when out of tears of repentance which, when out of love thorough, let down, nor when he asked for the vote to each of the angelic Presentation, or is pleasing to all the saints; or even if he had for their sins, or for every friend of the living thing, for his friends, or even very many, and wishes to make, or even at the dawning of the prayers of the brethren out of this world; or when specifically wishes to apologize perpetual Virgin Mary genetricis of interference; or even most of your Boniface, who wants to sing, and calls for the presence of love and prayers.”

Cathwulf is assumed to be Anglo-Saxon by this name. If he is Anglo-Saxon he is not the only Anglo-Saxon in the Carolingian church who knew of All Saints' Day. For the above mentioned Alcuin of York, advisor to Charlemagne and suggested author of the Metrical Calendar of York, writes following his retirement to the abbacy of Marmoutier Abbey, Tours:

Mart. 19 800 AD to Arno Archbishop of Salzburg: “Kalendis Novembris solemnitas omnium sanctorum. Ecce. venerande pater Arne, habes designatam solemnitatem omnium sanctorum, sicut diximus. Quam continue in mente retineas et semper anniversario tempore colere non desistas; attendens illud et intente considerans: quoniam, si Helias, unus ex illis in vetere testamento, oratione sua, dum voluit, claudere caelum potuit praevaricatoribus et aperire conversis, quanto magis omnes sancti in novo testamento? ubi eis specialiter et patenter claves regni caelestis commissae sunt, et claudere caelum possunt incredulis et aperire credentibus, si intima dilectione honorificantur a fidelibus et coluntur glorificatione eis condigna. Quod ut fieri digne possit a nobis, lumen verum, quod inluminat omnem hominem, Christus Iesus inluminet corda nostra, et pax Dei, quae exsuperat omnem sensum, per intercessionem omnium sanctorum eius, custodiat ea usque in diem aeternitatis. Hanc solemnitatem sanctissimam tribus diebus ieiunando orando missas canendo et elemosinas dando pro invicem sincera devotione praecedamus.”¹⁷¹

Translation:

¹⁷⁰ Charles J. B. Gaskoin, *Alcuin: His Life and His Work* (London 1904), 231

¹⁷¹ Jacques-Paul Migne, *Patrologiae*. Volume 100 (Paris 1863), 296

“First of November is the feast of All Saints. Behold. See, I have revered the father of Arne, you have the appointment and kept the feast of all the saints, as we said. And always keep in mind the continual anniversary of the time you would not desist; regarding it, and with all attention and considers that, if this is Elias, one of them in the Old Testament, a speech of his, when he desired, the transgressors could make the heavens to close and to open the converted, to all the saints in the New Testament, how much more? where the keys of the kingdom of heaven, have been entrusted to them in particular, and plainly, and to shut heaven and to open to those who believe they can be those who were disobedient, the glorification of them, if it is proportionate to the deep love is honored and worshiped by the faithful. In order to be able to be done in a manner worthy of ourselves, the true Light which gives light to every man, Christ Jesus, the light of our hearts, and the peace of God, which passeth all understanding, through the intercession of all the saints, his, shall keep it even to the day of eternity. This feast of the holy fasting for three days praying and singing masses by giving alms for another sincere devotion to redemption.”

However Archbishop Arno of Salzburg (785-821) is already aware of All Saints’ Day prior to Alcuin’s letter. For at the *Council of Riesbach* at which he was present in 798 AD, draws up a list of public holidays which includes All Saints’ Day on November 1st:

“(II). Ex concilio ad Risphach.

Festos dies celebrare sancimus, id est diem Paschae, similiter feria secunda, tertia, quarta et quinta. Ante missam licentia sit arandi et seminandi, bortum vel vineam excolendi et sepem circumeludendi. Ab alio vero opere cessare decrevimus, post missam autem ab opere vacare. Pentecosten similiter ut in Pascha, sancti Laurentii, Kalendas Novembris Omnium sanctorum, similiter dedicationes ecclesiarum.”¹⁷²

Translation:

“Council of Risphach to the council.

We ordain to celebrate the holiday season, that is, the day of Easter, in the same day of the week the second, the third, the fourth and the fifth. Is it permitted to have done, and not been let before plowing, the garden, the vineyard, and hedged it travels in a circuit to feed the soul of play. After the Mass, however, have decided to cease from the work, and from the other the work of the divine. Pentecost, like the one at the passover, St. Lawrence, first of November all saints, in like manner dedication of the church.”

The premise that *Samain*, through English Church, was the origin of All Saints’ Day, ignores the continental sources that reflect the movement of All Martyrs to November 1st. The semantic shift in the meaning of *Samain* and the lack of such beginning of winter festival within Byrthonic culture reflects that All Saints’ Day was a Christian recreation and that it is the pre-Christian celebration which has moved and not *vice versa*.

¹⁷² Albert Werminghoff, *Concilia aevi Karolini*, Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Part 1, Volume 2 (Hanover 1806), 197

Conclusion

Etymologically *Samain* belongs to summer (the months of May, June and July). The source of the semantic shift in the meaning of *Samain* is due to its association with All Martyrs' Day and its transference to All Saints' Day within the Christian calendar. Hence resolving the etymological conflict and solving for Dr McCone's observation of the two Samains.

Armed with this knowledge it becomes possible understanding the original meaning of tales. However although it is argued that Samain was associated with May 13th and All Martyrs' Day, further research is needed to understand the reality of the native Irish calendar prior to the arrival of Christianity.

Appendix A – Trinus Samoni as cognate of Trenae Samna

1. TRIN VX, the Latin distributive numeral of three?

The inscriptions on the seventeenth day of the month of *Samonios*, i.e. *ATE II*, in the Gaulish Coligny Calendar are:

Year 1 - *TRINOSAM SINDIV*

Year 2 - *TRIN VXSAMO*

Year 3 - missing

Year 4 - *PRINI SAM SINDIV*

Year 5 - *PRINO SAMONI*

(*PRINI*¹⁷³ and *PRINO* are regarded as scribal errors of *TRINI* and *TRINO*.¹⁷⁴)

TRIN VX can be rewritten as *TRINUS*, from the association between ‘-vx’ and ‘-us’ as seen in Roman inscriptions. However ‘-vx’ or ‘-us’ suffixes are not found in Gaulish, however the suffix is found in Latin.

TRINUS is a Latin word, the masculine nominative singular form of the distributive numeral three.

TRINO is the Latin masculine singular dative/ablative form of *TRINUS*.

TRINI is the masculine nominative plural form of *TRINUS*.

SAMONIOS as with *TRINUS* is also masculine.

If *TRIN VX* is equivalent to *TRINUS*, the Latin distributive numeral three: Then the Old Irish *Trían* could be expected to also mean the distributive numeral three, due to the association of the Gaulish *TRIN VX SAMON* with Old Irish *Trenae Samna*, an alternative name for *Samain*.

1. *Trían* modern Irish ‘one-third’?

The modern Irish meaning of *Trían* and for the past three hundred year is ‘one-third’:

Edward Lhuyd, *Archaeologia Britannica, Volume 1* (Oxford 1707):

“Trian, The third part : Da Trian, Two thirds.”

¹⁷³ *PRINI* appear elsewhere in the Coligny and described by Václav Blažek as: “*PRINNI* is probably the gen. of **prinno-*, corresponding to *prenne* “tree” from the Viennese Glossar, W., B. *prenn* “wood”, OIr. *crann* “tree.” Václav Blažek, *Gaulish Language, Gaulish Language. Sborník prací filozofické fakulty brněnské univerzity / Studia minora facultatis philosophicae universitatis brunensis*, 2008

¹⁷⁴ Paul-Marie Duval, ‘Observations sur le calendrier de Coligny’, *Études celtiques* Volume 11 (Paris 1965), 304

John O'Brien and Edward Lhuyd, *Focalóir Gaoidhíle-sax-bhéarla* (Paris 1768):

“Trian, the third parts. Dà thriàn, two thirds.”

William Shaw, *A Galic And English Dictionary* (London 1780):

“Trian. A third part.”

Edward O'Reilly, *An Irish-English Dictionary with a Compendious Irish Grammar* (Dublin 1821):

“trian, s. a third part”

“trian, s. a district”

Dictionarium Scoto-Celticum, (Edinburgh 1828):

“TRIAN, s. m. ind. (Tri, et Aon), A third part: tertia pars. "Agus ta\laidh anns an fhearann uile, tha an Tighearn ag ra\dh, gu 'n gearrar as da thrian ann." Sechar, xiii. 8. And it shall come pass, in all the land saith the Lord, that two third parts shall be cut off. Et eveniet in terra tota ait Dominus Deus ut excidetur duas tertias partes.”

Norman Macleod, Daniel Dewar, *A Dictionary of the Gaelic Language in Two Parts* (Glasgow 1831):

“TRIAN, s. m. ind. (Tri and Aon,) A third part.”

Neil MacAlpine, *A pronouncing Gaelic dictionary* (Edinburgh 1833)

“Trian, tréän, n. m. third, third part; gearrar dà thrian, two-thirds shall be cut, Bibl; trian do shoillse, a particle of light. Ossian.”

Edil (online at Edil.qub.ac.uk/dictionary/) accessed 07 24 2007:

“Trían, meaning: third part”

2. *Trían*, a semantic shift?

The Irish usage of *Trían* for the fraction 1/3, conflicts with the Indo-European pattern of fraction formation. An ordinal numeral is used as the denominator and cardinal numeral for the numerator. For example in the English it is ‘one third’. The Old Irish ordinal numeral for three is *tris(s)* or *tres(s)* and not *trían*.

The break with Indo-European languages suggests a semantic shift has occurred in the usage of *Trían*. Could the Old Irish *Trían* have once meant the same meaning as Latin *TRINUS*, and even been its cognate?

3. **trisno* Proto Indo-European distributive numeral of three

Latin *Trinus* is identified as being from the Proto Indo-European root **trisno*

“12.4.0 Distributives, ... , 12.4.3 ‘Three’

It is not clear whether Latin *ternī*, e.g. Pl. Mer. 304, or the rare *tīrnī*, e.g. Pl. Ps. 704, is the regular Latin reflex of **triso-*, which is represented elsewhere by Oícel *Prenner*, sg. *Prennr*. If the former, then *trini* is by analogy with *bini*; if the latter, then *terni* would represent the assimilation of the pattern **triso-*: **dwisno-* to *ter* : *dwis*.”¹⁷⁵

“**triso-* > Latin *trini* “threefold”, while *terni* “three each” can reflect simply **tri-no-*”¹⁷⁶

“3. Some PIE distributives were formed with adj. suffix *-(s)no-*, and abstract/collective suffix *-ī*; as *dwīsnī*, two at a time, two each, *trīsnī*, *qátrusnī*.”¹⁷⁷

While Old English *þrinen* and Middle English *threenen* are cognates of the Old Icelandic *þrennr*. However modern English, as common to other Indo-European language, no longer use a word for the distributive numeral from the root **triso*. Instead using ‘triply’, derived from the multiplier *triple* (of Latin origin via French) suffixed with ‘-y’ (reduction of Middle English ‘-lely’ > ‘-ly’).

In English the distributive numeral 3 is also commonly expressed paraphrastically: *three by three*; *three at a time*; *in threes*; or using a counter word such as *in groups of three* or *three pieces to a ...*

Or with suffixes *-some* (as in *threesome*) and *-fold* (as in *threefold*) are also used. As well as the use of distributive numbers is in *arity* or *adicity*, to indicate how many parameters a function takes, i.e. Latin distributive numbers and *-ary*, as in *ternary*; or sometimes Greek with *-adic*, as in *triadic*.

4. *Tríanach* as the Irish distributive numeral of three

The modern Irish *Tríanach* is an adjective formed from *Trían*. And is defined as, *three by three, of the third part, thirdly* and *threefold*, i.e., in the English manner for expressing the distributive numeral three. When an author turns to Latin they use *TRINUS* or its female cognative *Ternus/Terni* (i.e. the root of English *ternary*).

Edward Lhuyd, *Archaeologia Britannica, Volume 1* (Oxford 1707)

“TRIANACH, Three by three. Pl.”

John O'Brien and Edward Lhuyd, *Focalóir Gaoidhilge-sax-bhéarla* (Paris 1768):

“TRIANACH, three by three, *terni*.”

¹⁷⁵ Jadranka Gvozdanovic, *Indo-European Numerals* (Berlin – New York 1992), 420

¹⁷⁶ Václav Blažek, *Numerals* (Masarykova Univerzita 1999), 189

¹⁷⁷ Carlos Quiles, Fernando López-Menchero, *A Grammar of Modern Indo-European* (Indo-European Association 2012), 204

William Shaw, *A Galic And English Dictionary* (London 1780):

“TRIANACH, Three by three, of the third part”

Edward O'Reilly, *An Irish-English Dictionary with a Compendious Irish Grammar* (Dublin 1821):

“TRIANACH, three by three, of the third part, thirdly”

Robert Archibald Armstrong, *A Gaelic Dictionary in Two Parts* (London 1825):

“TRIANACH, a. (from trian.) Ir.id. Three by three; of the third part.”

Dictionarium Scoto-Celticum (Edinburgh 1828):

“TRIANACH, (Trian), Of the third part: *trinus, ternus*. “Trianach Iàn.” C. S. One third full : *plenus usque ad tertiam partem*.”

Norman Macleod, Daniel Dewar, *A Dictionary of the Gaelic Language in Two Parts* (Glasgow 1831):

“TRIANACH, adj. (Train,) Of the third”

Edil (online at Edil.qub.ac.uk/dictionary/) accessed 07 24 2007:

"tríanach o, a (1 trían) threefold, tripartite”

"treinech o, a (trí) In Mod. Ir. tréanach. threefold, tripartite”

Tríanach is equivalent to the Latin: *TRINUS, TRINO AND TRINO*.

5. *Trían* is the Irish distributive numeral of three

Trían is also defined in the mid-19th century as the distributive numeral three:

James Munro, *A Practical Grammar of the Scottish Gaelic* (1843):

"The distributive numbers, after leth, half, trian, third, ceithreamh or ceathramh; quarter, are formed by placing cuid, part, after the ordinals, cóigeamh, &c.; as an coigeamh cuid, &c., the 5th part, &c."

(Munro also gives the Irish the collective numeral three as *Triùir*.)

John Forbes, *The Principles of Gaelic Grammar* (1848):

"The distributive numbers are, leth, half; trian, third; ceathramh, a fourth, a quarter. Distributives higher than these are formed by placing the words pàirt or cuid after the ordinal numerals; as, an còigeamh pàirt, an cóigeamh cuid, the fifth part"

Hence *Trían* historically, like its adjective *Tríanach*, shared the same meaning as Latin *TRINUS*, 'distributive numeral three'. And the meaning of *Trinus Samon* and *Trenae Samna* are the same, "ternary of summer." Implying that same festival was celebrated by Gauls and Gaels.

(Whether Old Irish *Trían* is cognate of Latin *Trinus* depends on the relationship between the Proto Celtic **trí?ano-* and the Proto Indo European **trísno-*.)